## A BILL FOR AN ACT

RELATING TO PROPERTY FORFEITURE.

#### BE IT ENACTED BY THE LEGISLATURE OF THE STATE OF HAWAII:

1 SECTION 1. The legislature finds that civil asset 2 forfeiture laws are controversial and have been evolving 3 throughout the country over the thirty years since Hawai'i passed 4 the Omnibus Criminal Forfeiture Act, codified as chapter 712A, 5 Hawaii Revised Statutes, that covers civil asset forfeiture. 6 Hawai'i's process allows law enforcement agencies to seize and 7 keep property based on suspicion that the property is connected 8 to criminal activity. Property, such as vehicles, houses, cash, 9 and jewelry, can be taken without the property owner having been 10 convicted of a crime or even being formally accused of one.

Additionally, the legislature finds that there is great incentive for state and county law enforcement agencies to seize property for forfeiture, as these agencies are permitted to retain proceeds from the sale of the property. Under state law, one hundred per cent of the proceeds are divided among the state and county law enforcement agencies that were involved in the seizure and forfeiture.



#### **S.B. NO.** <sup>294</sup> S.D. 1

1 The legislature notes that the Institute for Justice, a 2 nonprofit civil liberties law firm, recommends abolishing civil forfeiture entirely, as at least three states - Nebraska, New 3 4 Mexico, and North Carolina - have done. Fifteen states now 5 require a criminal conviction for most or all forfeiture cases. 6 Additionally, the legislature takes note of the Institute of 7 Justice's "D-" rating of Hawai'i's civil forfeiture laws and the 8 characterization that the State's laws "are among the nation's 9 worst".

10 Furthermore, the Institute for Justice recommends other 11 reforms to make the forfeiture process fairer, beginning with 12 eliminating financial incentives for law enforcement to seize 13 and keep forfeited property and, instead, directing any proceeds 14 to the general revenue fund or other neutral fund. Eight 15 jurisdictions now prohibit law enforcement from keeping the 16 proceeds from forfeited property. A second reform is to adopt a 17 high standard of proof, such as "beyond a reasonable doubt", in 18 order to forfeit property in civil proceedings. Eighteen 19 jurisdictions have a standard higher than Hawai'i's "preponderance of the evidence" standard, and for ten of those 20 21 jurisdictions, it is equivalent to "beyond a reasonable doubt".



1 The third suggested reform, which a number of jurisdictions have 2 already made, involves requiring law enforcement to prove that 3 owners consented to or possessed knowledge of the crime that led to the seizure of their property, restoring the presumption of 4 5 innocence used in criminal proceedings. The legislature finds 6 that none of these recommendations have been implemented in 7 Hawaiʻi. 8 Accordingly, the purpose of this Act is to make the State's 9 civil asset forfeiture process more just by: 10 Restricting civil asset forfeiture to cases involving (1) 11 the commission of a felony offense where the property 12 owner has been convicted of an underlying felony 13 offense; and 14 (2) Directing any forfeiture proceeds to the general fund. 15 SECTION 2. Section 712A-5, Hawaii Revised Statutes, is

16 amended to read as follows:

17 "§712A-5 Property subject to forfeiture; exemption. (1)
18 The following is subject to forfeiture:

19 (a) Property described in a statute authorizing20 forfeiture;



1 (b) Property used or intended for use in the commission 2 of, attempt to commit, or conspiracy to commit a 3 covered offense, or which facilitated or assisted such 4 activity; 5 (C) Any firearm which is subject to forfeiture under any 6 other subsection of this section or which is carried 7 during, visible, or used in furtherance of the 8 commission, attempt to commit, or conspiracy to commit 9 a covered offense, or any firearm found in proximity 10 to contraband or to instrumentalities of an offense; Contraband or untaxed cigarettes in violation of 11 (d) 12 chapter 245, shall be seized and summarily forfeited 13 to the State without regard to the procedures set 14 forth in this chapter; 15 (e) Any proceeds or other property acquired, maintained, 16 or produced by means of or as a result of the 17 commission of the covered offense; 18 (f) Any property derived from any proceeds which were 19 obtained directly or indirectly from the commission of 20 a covered offense;

2021-1074 SB294 SD1 SMA.doc

## S.B. NO. <sup>294</sup> S.D. 1

1	(g)	Any interest in, security of, claim against, or
2		property or contractual right of any kind affording a
3		source of influence over any enterprise which has been
4		established, participated in, operated, controlled, or
5		conducted in order to commit a covered offense;
6	(h)	All books, records, bank statements, accounting
7		records, microfilms, tapes, computer data, or other
8		data which are used, intended for use, or which
9		facilitated or assisted in the commission of a covered
10		offense, or which document the use of the proceeds of
11		a covered offense.
12	(2)	Except that:
13	(a)	Real property, or an interest therein, may be
14		forfeited under the provisions of this chapter only in
15		cases in which the covered offense is chargeable as a
16		felony offense under state law;
17	(b)	No property shall be forfeited under this chapter to
18		the extent of an interest of an owner[ $_7$ ] by reason of
19		[any act or omission established by that owner to have
20		been committed or omitted without the knowledge and
21		consent of that owner;]:



1		i) The commission of any covered offense unless:
2		(A) The covered offense is chargeable as a
3		felony offense under state law; and
4		(B) The owner has been convicted of the covered
5		offense by a verdict or plea, including a no
6		contest plea or a deferred acceptance of
7		guilty plea or no contest plea; or
8		i) Any act or omission established by that owner to
9		have been committed or omitted without the
10		knowledge and consent of that owner;
11		provided that nothing in this paragraph shall be
12		construed to prevent the seizure of property prior to
13		conviction pursuant to section 712A-6;
14	(C)	o conveyance used by any person as a common carrier
15		n the transaction of a business as a common carrier
16		s subject to forfeiture under this section unless it
17		ppears that the owner or other person in charge of
18		he conveyance is a consenting party or privy to a
19		iolation of this chapter;
20	(d)	o conveyance is subject to forfeiture under this
21		ection by reason of any act or omission established



1		by the owner thereof to have been committed or omitted
2		without the owner's knowledge or consent; [and]
3	(e)	A forfeiture of a conveyance encumbered by a bona fide
4		security interest is subject to the interest of the
5		secured party if the secured party neither had
6		knowledge of nor consented to the act or omission[-];
7		and
8	(f)	This chapter shall not apply to the forfeiture of an
9		animal prior to disposition of criminal charges
10		pursuant to section 711-1109.2.
11	(3)	This section shall not prohibit or restrict
12	forfeitur	es authorized under other chapters."
13	SECT	ION 3. Section 712A-16, Hawaii Revised Statutes, is
14	amended to	o read as follows:
15	"§712	2A-16 Disposition of property forfeited. (1) All
16	property :	forfeited to the State under this chapter shall be
17	transferre	ed to the attorney general, who:
18	[ <del>(a)</del>	May-transfer property, other-than currency, which
19		shall be distributed in accordance with subsection (2)
20		to any local or state government entity, municipality,
21		or law enforcement agency within the State;

2021-1074 SB294 SD1 SMA.doc

#### **S.B. NO.** <sup>294</sup> S.D. 1

1 (a) May sell forfeited property to the public by <del>(b)</del>] 2 public sale; provided that for leasehold real 3 property: 4 (i) The attorney general shall first offer the holder 5 of the immediate reversionary interest the right 6 to acquire the leasehold interest and any 7 improvements built or paid for by the lessee for 8 the then fair market value of the leasehold 9 interest and improvements. The holder of the 10 immediate reversionary interest shall have thirty 11 days after receiving written notice within which 12 to accept or reject the offer in writing; 13 provided that the offer shall be deemed to be 14 rejected if the holder of the immediate 15 reversionary interest has not communicated 16 acceptance to the attorney general within the 17 thirty-day period. The holder of the immediate 18 reversionary interest shall have thirty days 19 after acceptance to tender to the attorney 20 general the purchase price for the leasehold 21 interest and any improvements, upon which tender



1			the leasehold interest and improvements shall be
2			conveyed to the holder of the immediate
3			reversionary interest[-] <u>;</u>
4		(ii)	If the holder of the immediate reversionary
5			interest fails to exercise the right of first
6			refusal provided in subparagraph (i), the
7			attorney general may proceed to sell the
8			leasehold interest and any improvements by public
9			<pre>sale[-]; and</pre>
10		(iii)	Any dispute between the attorney general and the
11			holder of the immediate reversionary interest as
12			to the fair market value of the leasehold
13			interest and improvements shall be settled by
14			arbitration pursuant to chapter 658A;
15	[ <del>(c)</del> ]	<u>(b)</u>	May sell or destroy all raw materials, products,
16		and e	equipment of any kind used or intended for use in
17		manut	facturing, compounding, or processing a controlled
18		subst	tance or any untaxed cigarettes in violation of
19		chapt	cer 245;
20	[ <del>-(d)</del> ]	(c)	May compromise and pay valid claims against
21		prope	erty forfeited pursuant to this chapter; or



## **S.B. NO.** <sup>294</sup> S.D. 1

1	[ <del>(e)</del> ]	(d) May make any other disposition of forfeited
2		property authorized by law.
3	(2)	All forfeited property and the sale proceeds thereof,
4	[ <del>up to a-</del>	maximum of three million-dollars per year, not
5	previousl	y transferred pursuant to [subsection] (1)(a) of this
6	section,	shall,] after payment of expenses of administration and
7	sale, [ <del>b</del> e	distributed as follows:
8	<del>(a)</del>	One quarter shall be distributed to the unit or units
9		of state or local government [whose] officers or
10		employees conducted the investigation and caused the
11		arrest of the person whose property was forfeited or
12		seizure of the property for forfeiture;
13	<del>(b)</del>	One quarter shall be distributed to the prosecuting
14		attorncy who instituted the action producing the
15		forfeiture; and
16	<del>(c)</del>	One half shall be deposited into the criminal
17		forfeiture fund established by this chapter.
18	<del>(3)</del>	Property and money distributed to units of state and
19	<del>local gov</del>	ernment shall-be used for law enforcement purposes, and
20	<del>shall com</del>	plement but not supplant the funds regularly
21	<del>appropria</del>	ted for such purposes.] including reimbursement for any

# 2021-1074 SB294 SD1 SMA.doc

costs inc	urred by the department of the attorney general related
to the se	izure or storage of seized property, shall be deposited
to the cr	edit of the state general fund.
[-(4)	(3) There is established in the department of the
attorney	general a revolving fund to be known as the criminal
forfeitur	e fund, hereinafter referred to as the "fund" in which
shall be	deposited [one-half of the proceeds of a forfeiture and
<del>any penal</del>	ties paid pursuant to section 712A-10(6).] a portion of
the proce	eds of each sale made pursuant to this section that is
sufficien	t to cover expenses of administration and sale. All
moneys in	the fund shall be expended by the attorney general and
are appro	priated for [ <del>the following purposes:</del>
<del>(a)</del>	The] the payment of any expenses necessary to seize,
	detain, appraise, inventory, safeguard, maintain,
	advertise, or sell property seized, detained, or
	forfeited pursuant to this chapter or of any other
	necessary expenses incident to the seizure, detention,
	or forfeiture of [ <del>such</del> ] property and [ <del>such</del> ] contract
	services and payments to reimburse any federal, state,
	or county agency for any expenditures made to perform
	to the se to the cr [-(4) attorney forfeitur shall be any penal the proce sufficien moneys in are appro

2021-1074 SB294 SD1 SMA.doc

# **S.B. NO.** <sup>294</sup> S.D. 1

1	<del>(b)</del>	The payment of awards for information or assistance
2		leading to a civil or criminal proceeding;
3	<del>(c)</del>	The payment of supplemental sums to state and county
4		agencies for law enforcement purposes;
5	<del>(d)</del>	The payment of expenses arising in connection with
6		programs for training and education of law enforcement
7		officers;
8	<del>(e)</del>	The payment of expenses arising in connection with
9		enforcement pursuant to the drug nuisance abatement
10		unit in the department of the attorney general; and
11	- <del>(£)</del>	The payment of expenses arising in connection with the
12		law enforcement officer independent review board in
13		the department of the attorney general].
14	[ <del>(5)</del>	] (4) The attorney general [may, without regard to the
15	requireme	<del>nts of chapter 91, promulgate</del> ] shall adopt rules [ <del>and</del>
16	<del>regulatio</del>	ns] necessary to carry out the purpose of this chapter,
17	including	rules concerning the disposition of property, the use
18	of the fu	nd, and compromising and paying valid claims against
19	property	forfeited [ <del>pursuant to this chapter</del> ].
20	[ <del>(6)</del>	] <u>(5)</u> Not less than [ <del>twenty</del> ] <u>forty</u> days prior to the
21	convening	of each regular session, the attorney general shall

# 2021-1074 SB294 SD1 SMA.doc

1	provide t	o the legislature a report on the use of the Hawaii
2	omnibus c	riminal forfeiture act during the fiscal year preceding
3	the legis	lative session. The report shall include:
4	(a)	The total amount and type of property seized by law
5		enforcement agencies;
6	(b)	The total number of administrative and judicial
7		actions filed by prosecuting attorneys and the
8		disposition thereof;
9	(c)	The total number of claims or petitions for remission
10		or mitigation filed in administrative actions and the
11		dispositions thereof;
12	(d)	The total amount and type of property forfeited and
13		the sale proceeds thereof;
14	(e)	The total amount and type of property distributed to
15		units of state and local government;
16	(f)	The amount of money deposited into the criminal
17		forfeiture fund; and
18	(g)	The amount of money expended by the attorney general
19		from the criminal forfeiture fund under subsection
20		$\left[\frac{5}{5}\right]$ (4) and the reason for the expenditures."

2021-1074 SB294 SD1 SMA.doc

#### **S.B. NO.** <sup>294</sup> S.D. 1

1 SECTION 4. This Act does not affect rights and duties that matured, penalties that were incurred, and proceedings that were 2 3 begun before its effective date. 4 SECTION 5. Statutory material to be repealed is bracketed 5 and stricken. New statutory material is underscored. 6 SECTION 6. This Act shall take effect upon its approval; 7 provided that the amendments made to section 712A-16, Hawaii 8 Revised Statutes, by section 3 of this Act shall not be repealed 9 when section 712A-16, Hawaii Revised Statutes, is reenacted on 10 June 30, 2022, by section 7 of Act 161, Session Laws of Hawaii 11 2016.



**Report Title:** Property Forfeiture; Disposition

#### Description:

Restricts civil asset forfeiture to cases involving the commission of a felony offense where the property owner has been convicted of an underlying felony offense. Specifies that civil asset forfeiture restrictions do not apply to forfeitures authorized under other chapters of the Hawaii Revised Statutes. Directs any forfeiture proceeds to the general fund. (SD1)

The summary description of legislation appearing on this page is for informational purposes only and is not legislation or evidence of legislative intent.

