S.B. NO. <sup>1034</sup> s.d. 1

## A BILL FOR AN ACT

RELATING TO SUNSHINE LAW BOARDS.

### BE IT ENACTED BY THE LEGISLATURE OF THE STATE OF HAWAII:

1 SECTION 1. The legislature finds that the coronavirus 2 disease 2019 (COVID-19) pandemic forced the implementation of 3 emergency measures suspending certain requirements of the State's sunshine law in order to allow boards to continue 4 5 meeting and conducting necessary business while protecting 6 participants' health and safety and expanding public access to 7 meetings throughout the State. Due to the emergency 8 stay-at-home orders and travel restrictions, board members, 9 staff, or members of the public could not attend public meetings 10 in person. In lieu of traditional in-person meetings, remote 11 meetings connected people in different physical locations 12 through the use of interactive conference technology and thus 13 enabled and enhanced board and public participation.

14 The legislature further finds that, based on boards'
15 experiences with remote meetings during the COVID-19 pandemic,
16 the increased costs of staffing, technological equipment, and
17 resources needed to conduct remote meetings are offset by the

## 2021-2890 SB1034 HD2 HMS0

S.B. NO. <sup>1034</sup> S.D. 1 H.D. 2

1 savings in time, convenience, and travel costs for board members 2 and participants, especially those from the neighbor islands. 3 During the COVID-19 pandemic, remote meetings helped to prevent 4 the spread of disease, and even when there is not an ongoing 5 pandemic, remote meetings can be a way to protect the health and 6 safety of participants, particularly those who have disabilities 7 or medical conditions that would place them at greater risks 8 during travel or attendance at in-person public meetings.

9 The legislature additionally finds that the benefits of 10 remote meetings should continue in non-emergency times, 11 requiring permanent amendments to the sunshine law. For remote 12 meetings not held during times of emergency, there is a need for 13 boards to provide for an in-person meeting location where 14 members of the public can come to observe the remote meeting or 15 testify in person using interactive conference technology 16 equipment provided by the board, without requiring board members 17 to be at the in-person location.

18 The purpose of this Act is to allow boards the option to 19 use interactive conference technology to conduct remote meetings 20 under the sunshine law, while still retaining the option to 21 conduct traditional in-person meetings at a single meeting site

## 2021-2890 SB1034 HD2 HMSO

Page 2

### **S.B. NO.** <sup>1034</sup> <sup>S.D. 1</sup> <sup>H.D. 2</sup>

or at multiple meeting sites connected by interactive conference
 technology.

3 SECTION 2. Chapter 92, Hawaii Revised Statutes, is amended
4 by adding a new section to part I to be appropriately designated
5 and to read as follows:

### 6 "<u>§92-</u> Remote meeting by interactive conference

7 technology; notice; quorum. (a) A board may hold a remote

8 meeting by interactive conference technology; provided that the

9 interactive conference technology used by the board allows

10 audiovisual interaction among all members of the board

11 participating in the meeting and all members of the public

12 attending the meeting, except as otherwise provided under this

13 section. A board holding a remote meeting pursuant to this

14 section shall not be required to allow members of the public to

15 join board members in person at nonpublic locations where board

16 members are physically present or to identify those locations in

17 the notice required by section 92-7; provided that at the

18 meeting, each board member shall state who, if anyone, is

19 present at the nonpublic location with the member. The notice

20 required by section 92-7 shall:

## 2021-2890 SB1034 HD2 HMSO

S.B. NO.  $B_{\text{ND. 1}}^{1034}$ 

1	(1)	If requested by a member of the public at least three
2		working days before the meeting, list at least one
3		meeting location that is open to the public that shall
4		have an audiovisual connection; and
5	(2)	Inform members of the public how to contemporaneously:
6		(A) Remotely view the video and audio of the meeting
7		through internet streaming or other means; and
8		(B) Provide remote oral testimony in a manner that
9		allows board members and other meeting
10		participants to hear the testimony, whether
11		through an internet link, a telephone conference,
12		or other means.
13	The board	may provide additional locations open for public
14	participa	tion. The notice required by section 92-7 shall list
15	any addit	ional locations open for public participation and
16	specify,	in the event an additional location loses its
17	audiovisu	al connection to the remote meeting, whether the
18	meeting w	ill continue without that location or will be
19	automatic	ally recessed to restore communication as provided in
20	subsectio	n (c).

2021-2890 SB1034 HD2 HMSO

**S.B. NO.** <sup>1034</sup> S.D. 1 H.D. 2

1	(b)	For a remote meeting held by interactive conference
2	technolog	y pursuant to this section:
3	(1)	The interactive conference technology used by the
4		board shall allow interaction among all members of the
5		board participating in the meeting and all members of
6		the public attending the meeting;
7	(2)	Except as provided in subsections (c) and (d), all
8		board members participating in the meeting shall be
9		visible and audible to other members and the public
10		during the meeting; provided that so long as all board
11		members participating in the meeting are visible, no
12		other meeting participants shall be required to be
13		visible during the meeting;
14	(3)	Any board member participating in a meeting by
15		interactive conference technology shall be considered
16		present at the meeting for the purpose of determining
17		compliance with the quorum and voting requirements of
18		the board;
19	(4)	At the start of the meeting the presiding officer
20		shall announce the names of the participating members;

2021-2890 SB1034 HD2 HMSO

### S.B. NO. <sup>1034</sup> S.D. 1 H.D. 2

1	(5)	All votes on board action items shall be conducted by
2		roll call; and
3	(6)	When practicable, boards shall record meetings open to
4		the public and make the recording of any meeting
5		electronically available to the public as soon as
6		practicable after a meeting and until a time as the
7		minutes required by section 92-9 are electronically
8		posted on the board's website.
9	(c)	A meeting held by interactive conference technology
10	shall be	automatically recessed for up to one hour to restore
11	communica	tion when audiovisual communication cannot be
12	maintaine	d with all members participating in the meeting or with
13	the publi	c location identified in the board's notice pursuant to
14	subsectio	n (a)(1) or with the remote public broadcast identified
15	in the bo	ard's notice pursuant to subsection (a)(2)(A). This
16	subsectio	n shall not apply based on the inability of a member of
17	the publi	c to maintain an audiovisual connection to the remote
18	public br	oadcast, unless the remote public broadcast itself is
19	not trans	mitting an audiovisual link to the meeting. The
20	meeting m	ay reconvene when either audiovisual communication is
21	restored,	or audio-only communication is established after an



# S.B. NO. $B_{\text{H.D. 2}}^{1034}$

1	unsuccessful attempt to restore audiovisual communication, but
2	only if the board has provided reasonable notice to the public
3	as to how to access the reconvened meeting after an interruption
4	to communication. If audio-only communication is established,
5	then each speaker shall be required to state their name before
6	making their remarks. Within fifteen minutes after audio-only
7	communication is established, copies of nonconfidential visual
8	aids that are required by or brought to the meeting by board
9	members or as part of a scheduled presentation shall be made
10	available either by posting on the Internet or by other means to
11	all meeting participants, including those participating
12	remotely, and those agenda items for which visual aids are not
13	available for all participants shall not be acted upon at the
14	meeting. If it is not possible to reconvene the meeting as
15	provided in this subsection within one hour after an
16	interruption to communication and the board has not provided
17	reasonable notice to the public as to how the meeting will be
18	continued at an alternative date and time, then the meeting
19	shall be automatically terminated.
20	(d) During executive meetings from which the public has
21	been excluded, board members shall be audible to other



Page 7

### **S.B. NO.** <sup>1034</sup> S.D. 1 H.D. 2

1	authorized participants but shall not be required to be visible.
2	To preserve the executive nature of any portion of a meeting
3	closed to the public, the presiding officer shall publicly state
4	the names and titles of all authorized participants, and, upon
5	convening the executive session, all participants shall confirm
6	to the presiding officer that no unauthorized person is present
7	or able to hear them at their remote locations or via another
8	audio or audiovisual connection. The person organizing the
9	interactive conference technology shall confirm that no
10	unauthorized person has access to the executive meeting as
11	indicated on the control panels of the interactive conference
12	technology being used for the meeting, if applicable."
13	SECTION 3. Section 92-2, Hawaii Revised Statutes, is
14	amended by amending the definition of "interactive conference
15	technology" to read as follows:
16	""Interactive conference technology" means any form of
17	[ <del>audio or</del> ] audio and visual conference technology, <u>or audio</u>
18	conference technology where permitted under this part, including
19	teleconference, videoconference, and voice over internet
20	protocol, that facilitates interaction between the public and
21	board members."

2021-2890 SB1034 HD2 HMS0

Page 8

**S.B. NO.** <sup>1034</sup> <sup>S.D. 1</sup> <sup>H.D. 2</sup>

SECTION 4. Section 92-3.5, Hawaii Revised Statutes, is
 amended by amending its title and subsections (a) through (c) to
 read as follows:

"§92-3.5 [Meeting] In-person meeting at multiple sites by 4 5 interactive conference technology; notice; quorum. (a) A board 6 may hold [a] an in-person meeting at multiple meeting sites 7 connected by interactive conference technology; provided that 8 the interactive conference technology used by the board allows 9 audio or audiovisual interaction among all members of the board 10 participating in the meeting and all members of the public attending the meeting, and the notice required by section 92-7 11 12 identifies all of the locations where participating board 13 members will be physically present and indicates that members of 14 the public may join board members at any of the identified 15 The board may provide additional locations open for locations. 16 public participation but where no participating board members 17 will be physically present. The notice required by section 92-7 18 shall list any additional locations open for public 19 participation but where no participating board members will be 20 physically present and specify, in the event one of those 21 additional locations loses its audio connection to the meeting,



S.B. NO. <sup>1034</sup> S.D. 1

### whether the meeting will continue without that location or will 1 2 be automatically recessed to restore communication as provided in subsection (c). 3 4 Any board member participating in a meeting by (b) interactive conference technology under this section shall be 5 6 considered present at the meeting for the purpose of determining 7 compliance with the quorum and voting requirements of the board. 8 (c) A meeting held by interactive conference technology 9 under this section shall be [terminated] automatically recessed 10 for up to one hour to restore communication when audio 11 communication cannot be maintained with all locations where the 12 meeting by interactive conference technology is being held, even 13 if a quorum of the board is physically present in one location. 14 [If copies of visual aids required by, or brought to the meeting 15 by board members or members of the public, are not available to 16 all meeting participants, at all locations where audio-only 17 interactive conference technology is being used, within] The 18 meeting may reconvene when either audio or audiovisual 19 communication is restored. Within fifteen minutes after audio-20 only communication is [used,] established, copies of 21 nonconfidential visual aids that are required by or brought to

## 2021-2890 SB1034 HD2 HMSO

**S.B. NO.**  $_{H.D. 2}^{1034}$ 

1	the meeting by board members or as part of a scheduled
2	presentation shall be made available either by posting on the
3	Internet or by other means to all meeting participants, and
4	those agenda items for which visual aids are not available for
5	all participants at all meeting locations [cannot] shall not be
6	acted upon at the meeting. If it is not possible to reconvene
7	the meeting as provided in this subsection within one hour after
8	an interruption to communication, and the board has not provided
9	reasonable notice to the public as to how the meeting will be
10	continued at an alternative date and time, then the meeting
11	shall be automatically terminated."
12	SECTION 5. Section 92-7, Hawaii Revised Statutes, is
13	amended by amending subsection (a) to read as follows:
14	"(a) The board shall give written public notice of any
15	regular, special, emergency, or rescheduled meeting, or any
16	executive meeting when anticipated in advance. The notice shall
17	include an agenda that lists all of the items to be considered
18	at the forthcoming meeting; the date, time, and place of the
19	meeting; the board's electronic and postal contact information
20	for submission of testimony before the meeting; instructions on
21	how to request an auxiliary aid or service or an accommodation

## 2021-2890 SB1034 HD2 HMSO



1 due to a disability, including a response deadline, if one is 2 provided, that is reasonable; and in the case of an executive meeting, the purpose shall be stated. If an item to be 3 4 considered is the proposed adoption, amendment, or repeal of 5 administrative rules, an agenda meets the requirements for 6 public notice pursuant to this section if it contains a 7 statement on the topic of the proposed rules or a general description of the subjects involved, as described in 8 9 section 91-3(a)(1)(A), and a statement of when and where the 10 proposed rules may be viewed in person and on the Internet as 11 provided in section 91-2.6. The means specified by this section 12 shall be the only means required for giving notice under this 13 part notwithstanding any law to the contrary." 14 SECTION 6. Statutory material to be repealed is bracketed 15 and stricken. New statutory material is underscored.

16

SECTION 7. This Act shall take effect on May 6, 2137.





#### Report Title:

Sunshine Law; Interactive Conference Technology; Remote Meetings

### Description:

Authorizes boards to use interactive conference technology to remotely conduct meetings under the State's open meetings law. Amends the requirements for public notices of board meetings and for in-person board meetings held by interactive conference technology. Effective 5/6/2137. (HD2)

The summary description of legislation appearing on this page is for informational purposes only and is not legislation or evidence of legislative intent.

