A BILL FOR AN ACT

RELATING TO SUNSHINE LAW BOARDS.

BE IT ENACTED BY THE LEGISLATURE OF THE STATE OF HAWAII:

1	SECTION 1. The legislature finds that the coronavirus
2	disease 2019 (COVID-19) pandemic forced the implementation of
3	emergency measures suspending certain requirements of the
4	State's sunshine law in order to allow boards to continue
5	meeting and conducting necessary business while protecting
6	participants' health and safety and expanding public access to
7	meetings throughout the State. During the emergency stay-at-
8	home orders and travel restrictions, board members, staff, or
9	members of the public could not attend public meetings in
10	person. In lieu of traditional in-person meetings, remote
11	meetings connected people in different physical locations
12	through the use of interactive conference technology and thus
13	enabled and enhanced board and public participation.
14	The legislature further finds that, based on boards'
15	experiences with remote meetings during the COVID-19 pandemic,
16	the increased costs of staffing, technological equipment, and
17	resources needed to conduct remote meetings are offset by the

S.B. NO. 5.D. 1

- 1 savings in time, convenience, and travel costs for board members
- 2 and participants, especially those from the neighbor islands.
- 3 During the COVID-19 pandemic, remote meetings helped to prevent
- 4 the spread of disease, and even when there is not an ongoing
- 5 pandemic, remote meetings can be a way to protect the health and
- 6 safety of participants, particularly those who have disabilities
- 7 or medical conditions that would place them at greater risks
- 8 during travel or attendance at in-person public meetings.
- 9 The legislature additionally finds that the benefits of
- 10 remote meetings should continue in non-emergency times,
- 11 requiring permanent amendments to the sunshine law. For remote
- 12 meetings not held during times of emergency, there is a need for
- 13 boards to provide for an in-person meeting location where
- 14 members of the public can come to observe the remote meeting or
- 15 testify in person using interactive conference technology
- 16 equipment provided by the board, without requiring board members
- 17 to be at the in-person location.
- 18 The purpose of this Act is to allow boards the option to
- 19 use interactive conference technology to conduct remote meetings
- 20 under the sunshine law, while still retaining the option to
- 21 conduct traditional in-person meetings at a single meeting site

S.B. NO. 5.D. 1 H.D. 1

of at matciple meeting sites connected by interactive conference					
technology.					
SECTION 2. Chapter 92, Hawaii Revised Statutes, is amended					
by adding a new section to part I to be appropriately designated					
and to read as follows:					
"§92- Remote meeting by interactive conference					
technology; notice; quorum. (a) A board may hold a remote					
meeting by interactive conference technology. A board holding a					
remote meeting pursuant to this section shall not be required to					
allow members of the public to join board members in person at					
nonpublic locations where board members are physically present					
or to identify those locations in the notice required by					
section 92-7; provided that at the meeting, each board member					
shall state who, if anyone, is present at the nonpublic location					
with the member. The notice required by section 92-7 shall:					
(1) If requested by a member of the public at least					
seventy-two hours before the meeting, list at least					
one meeting location that is open to the public that					
shall have an audio-visual connection; and					
(2) Inform members of the public how to contemporaneously:					

S.B. NO. 5.D. 1 H.D. 1

1		<u>(A)</u>	Remotely view the video and audio of the meeting
2			through internet streaming or other means; and
3		<u>(B)</u>	Provide remote oral testimony in a manner that
4			allows board members and other meeting
5			participants to hear the testimony, whether
6			through an internet link, a telephone conference,
7			or other means.
8	The notic	e req	uired by section 92-7 may list additional
9	locations	open	for public participation and shall specify, in
10	the event	an a	dditional location loses its audio-visual
11	connectio	n to	the remote meeting, whether the meeting will
12	continue	witho	ut that location or will be automatically recessed
13	to restor	e com	munication as provided in subsection (c).
14	(b)	For	a remote meeting held by interactive conference
15	technolog	y pur	suant to this section:
16	(1)	The	interactive conference technology used by the
17		boar	d shall allow interaction among all members of the
18		boar	d participating in the meeting and all members of
19		the	public attending the meeting;
20	(2)	Exce	pt as provided in subsections (c) and (d), a
21		quor	um of board members shall be visible and audible

. 1		to other members and the public during the meeting;
2		provided that so long as a quorum of board members is
3		visible, no other meeting participants shall be
4		required to be visible during the meeting;
5	(3)	Any board member participating in a meeting by
6		interactive conference technology shall be considered
7		present at the meeting for the purpose of determining
8		compliance with the quorum and voting requirements of
9		the board;
10	(4)	At the start of the meeting the presiding officer
11		shall announce the names of the participating members;
12	(5)	All votes shall be conducted by roll call; and
13	(6)	When practicable, boards shall record meetings open to
14		the public and make the recording of any meeting
15		electronically available to the public as soon as
16		practicable after a meeting and until a time as the
17		minutes required by section 92-9 are electronically
18		posted on the board's website.
19	(c)	A meeting held by interactive conference technology
20	shall be	automatically recessed for up to one hour to restore
21	communica	tion when audiovisual communication cannot be

1

2 identified in the board's notice pursuant to subsection (a) (1) 3 or with the remote public broadcast identified in the board's 4 notice pursuant to subsection (a)(2)(A). This subsection shall 5 not apply based on the inability of a member of the public to 6 maintain an audiovisual connection to the remote public 7 broadcast, unless the remote public broadcast itself is not 8 transmitting an audiovisual link to the meeting. The meeting 9 may reconvene when either audiovisual communication is restored, 10 or audio-only communication is established after an unsuccessful 11 attempt to restore audiovisual communication, but only if the 12 board has provided reasonable notice to the public as to how to 13 access the reconvened meeting after an interruption to 14 communication. If audio-only communication is established, then 15 each speaker shall be required to state their name prior to 16 making their remarks. Within fifteen minutes after audio-only 17 communication is established, copies of nonconfidential visual 18 aids, which are required by or brought to the meeting by board 19 members or as part of a scheduled presentation, shall be made 20 available either by posting on the Internet or by other means to 21 all meeting participants, including those participating

maintained with a quorum of members or with the public location

1 remotely, and those agenda items for which visual aids are not 2 available for all participants shall not be acted upon at the 3 meeting. If it is not possible to reconvene the meeting as provided in this subsection within one hour after an 5 interruption to communication and the board has not provided 6 reasonable notice to the public as to how the meeting will be 7 continued at an alternative date and time, then the meeting 8 shall be automatically terminated. 9 (d) During executive meetings from which the public has 10 been excluded, board members shall be audible to other authorized participants and are not required to be visible. To 11 12 preserve the executive nature of any portion of a meeting closed 13 to the public, the presiding officer shall publicly state the 14 names and titles of all authorized participants, and upon convening the executive session all participants shall confirm 15 to the presiding officer that no unauthorized person is present 16 or able to hear them at their remote locations or via another 17 audio or audio-visual connection. The person organizing the 18 19 interactive conference technology shall confirm that no

unauthorized person has access to the executive meeting as

20

- 1 indicated on the control panels of the interactive conference
- 2 technology being used for the meeting, if applicable."
- 3 SECTION 3. Section 92-2, Hawaii Revised Statutes, is
- 4 amended by amending the definition of "interactive conference
- 5 technology" to read as follows:
- 6 ""Interactive conference technology" means any form of
- 7 [audio or] audio and visual conference technology, or audio
- 8 conference technology where permitted under this part, including
- 9 teleconference, videoconference, and voice over internet
- 10 protocol, that facilitates interaction between the public and
- 11 board members."
- 12 SECTION 4. Section 92-3.5, Hawaii Revised Statutes, is
- 13 amended by amending its title and subsections (a) through (c) to
- 14 read as follows:
- 15 "§92-3.5 [Meeting] In-person meeting at multiple sites by
- 16 interactive conference technology; notice; quorum. (a) A board
- 17 may hold [a] an in-person meeting at multiple meeting sites
- 18 connected by interactive conference technology; provided that
- 19 the interactive conference technology used by the board allows
- 20 audio or audiovisual interaction among all members of the board
- 21 participating in the meeting and all members of the public

- 1 attending the meeting, and the notice required by section 92-7
- 2 identifies all of the locations where participating board
- 3 members will be physically present and indicates that members of
- 4 the public may join board members at any of the identified
- 5 locations. The notice may list additional locations open for
- 6 public participation but where no participating board members
- 7 will be physically present, and in the event one of those
- 8 additional locations loses its audio connection to the remote
- 9 meeting, the notice shall specify whether the meeting will
- 10 continue without that location or will be automatically recessed
- 11 to restore communication as provided in subsection (c).
- 12 (b) Any board member participating in a meeting by
- 13 interactive conference technology under this section shall be
- 14 considered present at the meeting for the purpose of determining
- 15 compliance with the quorum and voting requirements of the board.
- 16 (c) A meeting held by interactive conference technology
- 17 under this section shall be [terminated] automatically recessed
- 18 for up to one hour to restore communication when audio
- 19 communication cannot be maintained with all locations where the
- 20 meeting by interactive conference technology is being held, even
- 21 if a quorum of the board is physically present in one location.

S.B. NO. 5.D. 1

- 1 [If copies of visual aids required by, or brought to the meeting
- 2 by board members or members of the public, are not available to
- 3 all meeting participants, at all locations where audio-only
- 4 interactive conference technology is being used, within] The
- 5 meeting may reconvene when either audio or audio-visual
- 6 communication is restored. Within fifteen minutes after audio-
- 7 only communication is [used,] established, copies of
- 8 nonconfidential visual aids, which are required by or brought to
- 9 the meeting by board members or as part of a scheduled
- 10 presentation, shall be made available either by posting on the
- 11 Internet or by other means to all meeting participants,
- 12 including those participating remotely, and those agenda items
- 13 for which visual aids are not available for all participants at
- 14 all meeting locations [eannot] shall not be acted upon at the
- 15 meeting. If it is not possible to reconvene the meeting as
- 16 provided in this subsection within one hour after an
- 17 interruption to communication, and the board has not provided
- 18 reasonable notice to the public as to how the meeting will be
- 19 continued at an alternative date and time, then the meeting
- 20 shall be automatically terminated."

```
SECTION 5. Section 92-7, Hawaii Revised Statutes, is
1
    amended by amending subsection (a) to read as follows:
 2
3
               The board shall give written public notice of any
4
    regular, special, emergency, or rescheduled meeting, or any
5
    executive meeting when anticipated in advance. The notice shall
    include an agenda that lists all of the items to be considered
7
    at the forthcoming meeting; the date, time, and place of the
    meeting; the board's electronic and postal contact information
8
9
    for submission of testimony before the meeting; instructions on
10
    how to request an auxiliary aid or service or an accommodation
    due to a disability, including a response deadline, if one is
11
12
    provided, that is reasonable; and in the case of an executive
13
    meeting the purpose shall be stated. If an item to be
14
    considered is the proposed adoption, amendment, or repeal of
15
    administrative rules, an agenda meets the requirements for
16
    public notice pursuant to this section if it contains a
17
    statement on the topic of the proposed rules or a general
18
    description of the subjects involved, as described in
19
    section 91-3(a)(1)(A), and a statement of when and where the
20
    proposed rules may be viewed in person and on the Internet as
21
    provided in section 91-2.6. The means specified by this section
```

S.B. NO. 5.D. 1

- 1 shall be the only means required for giving notice under this
- part notwithstanding any law to the contrary."
- 3 SECTION 6. Statutory material to be repealed is bracketed
- 4 and stricken. New statutory material is underscored.
- 5 SECTION 7. This Act shall take effect on May 6, 2137.

Report Title:

Sunshine Law; Interactive Conference Technology; Remote Meetings

Description:

Authorizes boards, in conjunction with in-person meetings, to use interactive conference technology to remotely conduct public meetings. Authorizes boards to exclude the public from nonpublic locations where board members are physically present when remote board meetings are held by interactive conference technology. Establishes requirements for the conduct of remote meeting. Requires remote meetings held by interactive conference technology to recess for a maximum prescribed period when audiovisual communication cannot be maintained by the board and allows the meeting to be reconvened under certain circumstances. Establishes a new notice requirement to provide the board's contact information for the submission of written testimony by electronic or postal mail, which also applies to remote meeting agendas. Allows for additional courtesy sites open to the public for remote and in-person meetings held by interactive conference technology. Effective 5/6/2137. (HD1)

The summary description of legislation appearing on this page is for informational purposes only and is not legislation or evidence of legislative intent.