H.C.R. NO. 5

HOUSE CONCURRENT RESOLUTION

ESTABLISHING A JOINT COMMITTEE ON JUDICIAL SELECTION.

WHEREAS, Hawaii's Judicial Selection Commission was 1 proposed by the 1978 Constitutional Convention as a method of 2 selecting judges based solely on their qualifications and not on 3 4 political patronage; and 5 WHEREAS, this merit-based selection process was intended to 6 assure the public that only the candidates best qualified for a 7 vacancy would be considered for judicial appointment; and 8 9 WHEREAS, however, doubts have been raised over the years 10 regarding the selection and retention of judges and justices and 11 the closed and confidential operations of the Judicial Selection 12 Commission; and 13 14 WHEREAS, Hawaii's judicial selection process is shrouded in 15 unlimited secrecy due to strict laws and rules regulating 16 disclosure; and 17 18 WHEREAS, deliberations of the Judicial Selection Commission 19 are further determined to be confidential pursuant to the 20 21 Constitution of the State of Hawaii; and 22 WHEREAS, to keep deliberations confidential, the rules of 23 the Judicial Selection Commission provide, in perpetuity, 24 blanket confidentiality for information relating to the identity 25 of any applicant, information received from or about current or 26 former applicants and petitioners, and any communications among 27 or votes by commissioners that have transpired in the course of 28 their deliberations on any subject; and 29 30 WHEREAS, the only time an applicant's name is publicly 31 released is upon nomination by the Judicial Selection Commission 32

2021-0708 HCR HMSO-1

H.C.R. NO. 5

for a vacant judicial position as provided by the Constitution 1 of the State of Hawaii; and 2 3 4 WHEREAS, the continued opacity of Hawaii's judicial selection process may further erode public confidence in the 5 judicial selection process and, by extension, the Judiciary; and 6 7 8 WHEREAS, Hawaii's merit-based judicial selection process can only be preserved through public confidence and public 9 confidence requires full disclosure of the process and the need 10 for confidentiality as an inherent part of merit-based judicial 11 selection; and 12 13 WHEREAS, to preserve Hawaii's merit-based selection 14 15 process, it is critical that the public has a clear understanding of the thorough process utilized by the Judicial 16 Selection Commission in selecting and retaining judges and 17 18 justices; and 19 20 WHEREAS, the rules of the Judicial Selection Commission do not identify any clear or measurable evaluation standards for 21 applicants or petitioners for judicial office, including 22 standards that address the specific skills that are required for 23 trial or appellate courts and the knowledge required for courts 24 with specialized jurisdiction; and 25 26 27 WHEREAS, establishing clear, defined standards for evaluating applicants and petitioners for judicial office will 28 29 promote public confidence that the best qualified applicants are being selected and quality petitioners are retained in a 30 consistent manner and assure applicants and petitioners that 31 they will be held to predictable and transparent standards; and 32 33 34 WHEREAS, the efficiency and operations of the Judicial Selection Commission could also be improved with an orientation 35 36 program for new members of the Commission and annual training 37 for all members of the Commission; and 38 WHEREAS, the Judicial Selection Commission's voting process 39 can be streamlined by amending the voting system, voting for 40 41 multiple lists at the same time, or authorizing remote 42 participation; now, therefore,

2021-0708 HCR HMSO-1

H.C.R. NO. 5

1 2 3 4	Thirty-fi of 2021,	T RESOLVED by the House of Representatives of the rst Legislature of the State of Hawaii, Regular Session the Senate concurring, that the Joint Committee on
5 6 7		Selection shall be established to work with the Selection Commission and Judiciary to:
7 8 9 10	(1)	Develop clear, written standards for evaluating applicants and petitioners for judicial office;
10 11 12 13	(2)	Develop protocols for training new and existing members of the Judicial Selection Commission;
14 15 16	(3)	Streamline the Judicial Selection Commission's voting rules;
17 18 19	(4)	Define the term "deliberations" under article VI, section 4, of the Hawaii State Constitution; and
20 21 22	(5)	Create greater transparency as to the rules and procedures applicable to the Judicial Selection Commission; and
23 24 25		T FURTHER RESOLVED that the Joint Committee on Judicial shall consist of the following members:
26 27 28	(1)	Two members appointed by the Speaker of the House of Representatives;
29 30 31	(2)	Two members appointed by the Senate President;
31 32 33	(3)	One member appointed by the Governor;
34 35	(4)	One member appointed by the Chief Justice of the Hawaii Supreme Court; and
36 37 38	(5)	One member appointed by the Hawaii State Bar Association; and
39 40 41 42		T FURTHER RESOLVED that the Legislative Reference requested to assist the Joint Committee on Judicial ; and

2021-0708 HCR HMSO-1

Page 4

H.C.R. NO. 5

1 BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the Joint Committee on Judicial 2 3 Selection, with the assistance of the Legislative Reference Bureau, is requested to submit a report of its findings and 4 recommendations, including any proposed legislation, to the 5 6 Legislature no later than twenty days prior to the convening of the Regular Session of 2022; and 7 8 9 BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that a certified copy of this 10 Concurrent Resolution be transmitted to the Governor, Speaker of the House of Representatives, President of the Senate, Chief 11 12 Justice of the Hawaii Supreme Court, Chairperson of the Judicial Selection Commission, Executive Director of the Hawaii State Bar 13 Association, and Director of the Legislative Reference Bureau. 14 15 16 17 Benne 1911 OFFERED BY:

JAN 2 2 2021

