A BILL FOR AN ACT

RELATING TO DOMESTIC VIOLENCE.

BE IT ENACTED BY THE LEGISLATURE OF THE STATE OF HAWAII:

- 1 SECTION 1. The legislature finds that Oregon has adopted a
- 2 pioneering approach to addressing certain challenges associated
- 3 with prosecuting domestic violence cases in which the victims
- 4 are uncooperative. Victims in these cases are often reluctant
- 5 to testify in court and may ignore court subpoenas to appear for
- 6 trial. This reluctance has been attributed to fear of the
- 7 perpetrator, consequences threatened by the perpetrator if the
- 8 victim testifies, or more generally to the complicated dynamic
- 9 of abusive relationships in which the abuser wields power and
- 10 control over the victim while promising to change and begging
- 11 for forgiveness between acts of violence.
- More specifically, the legislature finds that Oregon's
- 13 rules of evidence provide a limited hearsay exception for a
- 14 statement made by a victim of domestic violence to a government
- 15 official within twenty-four hours of a domestic violence attack,
- 16 even if the statement is testimonial in nature, as long as the

- 1 statement bears "sufficient indicia of reliability", which is a
- 2 determination made by the trial judge.
- 3 The legislature notes that the general prohibition on the
- 4 use of hearsay evidence stems from the federal and state
- 5 constitutional right of a defendant in a criminal trial to
- 6 confront the defendant's accusers. This right was examined at
- 7 length in the United States Supreme Court's 2004 opinion in
- 8 Crawford v. Washington, 541 U.S. 36, and clarified by the Court
- 9 in Davis v. Washington, 547 U.S. 813 (2006) and Michigan v.
- 10 Bryant, 562 U.S. 344 (2011). However, a 2017 article in the
- 11 Boston College Journal of Law and Social Justice noted that
- 12 Oregon's hearsay exception adequately safeguards a defendant's
- 13 confrontation right by setting a clear time limit for the
- 14 admissible hearsay statement to be made, and that in a domestic
- 15 violence context, victim statements made within twenty-four
- 16 hours of an incident are the most reliable. After this window,
- 17 the willingness of victims to cooperate diminishes, the
- 18 potential for coercion increases, and memories become less
- 19 clear.
- The legislature further notes that Oregon's hearsay
- 21 exception is premised on a policy approach that treats domestic

H.B. NO. H.D. 1

- 1 violence cases as a form of "ongoing emergency". That is, given
- 2 the statistics showing that incidents of domestic violence tend
- 3 to escalate over time and sometimes culminate in the victim's
- 4 death, the mere fact that a single domestic violence attack has
- 5 ended does not necessarily mean that the emergency has ended.
- 6 The legislature believes that recognition of a domestic violence
- 7 incident as being part of a larger ongoing emergency is what
- 8 distinguishes, and makes admissible in certain circumstances,
- 9 what may otherwise be considered an inadmissible hearsay
- 10 statement under Davis v. Washington; Michigan v. Bryant; and
- 11 State v. Fields, 115 Haw. 503 (2007), a Hawaii supreme court
- 12 opinion that discussed the holdings of the aforementioned
- 13 federal cases. The legislature further believes that to
- 14 effectively prosecute domestic violence cases and hold offenders
- 15 accountable, the Hawaii rules of evidence must strike a balance
- 16 between protecting the constitutional rights of defendants while
- 17 promoting the safety of domestic violence victims and the larger
- 18 society. In striking this balance, the legislature realizes
- 19 that there may be constitutional problems with Oregon's hearsay
- 20 exception, and thus has added features to further protect
- 21 defendants' rights and maintain constitutionality under

- 1 Michigan v. Bryant, while also preserving the intent of Oregon's
- 2 exception.
- 3 Accordingly, the purpose of this Act is to allow a narrow
- 4 hearsay exception for statements made by a domestic violence
- 5 victim during the course of the first interaction with the
- 6 responding law enforcement officers and before the defendant is
- 7 arrested, regardless of the availability of the declarant, as
- 8 long as the statement bears sufficient indicia of reliability.
- 9 SECTION 2. Section 626-1, Hawaii Revised Statutes, is
- 10 amended by amending rule 803, subsection (b), to read as
- 11 follows:
- "(b) Other exceptions.
- 13 (1) Present sense impression. A statement describing or
- 14 explaining an event or condition made while the
- 15 declarant was perceiving the event or condition or
- immediately thereafter.
- 17 (2) Excited utterance. A statement relating to a
- 18 startling event or condition made while the declarant
- was under the stress of excitement caused by the event
- or condition.

1	(3)	Then existing mental, emotional, or physical
2		condition. A statement of the declarant's then
3		existing state of mind, emotion, sensation, or
4		physical condition [(such], such as intent, plan,
5		motive, design, mental feeling, pain, and bodily
6		health[+], but not including a statement of memory or
7		belief to prove the fact remembered or believed unles
8		it relates to the execution, revocation,
9		identification, or terms of $\underline{\text{the}}$ declarant's will.

- 10 (4) Statements for purposes of medical diagnosis or
 11 treatment. Statements made for purposes of medical
 12 diagnosis or treatment and describing medical history,
 13 or past or present symptoms, pain, or sensations, or
 14 the inception or general character of the cause or
 15 external source thereof insofar as reasonably
 16 pertinent to diagnosis or treatment.
- **17** (5) Reserved.
- 18 (6) Records of regularly conducted activity. A

 19 memorandum, report, record, or data compilation, in

 20 any form, of acts, events, conditions, opinions, or

 21 diagnoses, made in the course of a regularly conducted

activity, at or near the time of the acts, events,
conditions, opinions, or diagnoses, as shown by the
testimony of the custodian or other qualified witness,
or by certification that complies with rule 902(11) or
a statute permitting certification, unless the sources
of information or other circumstances indicate lack of
trustworthiness.

- (7) Absence of entry in records kept in accordance with the provisions of paragraph (6). Evidence that a matter is not included in the memoranda, reports, records, or data compilations, in any form, kept in accordance with the provisions of paragraph (6), to prove the nonoccurrence or nonexistence of the matter, if the matter was of a kind of which a memorandum, report, record, or data compilation was regularly made and preserved, unless the sources of information or other circumstances indicate lack of trustworthiness.
- (8) Public records and reports. Records, reports, statements, or data compilations, in any form, of public offices or agencies, setting forth (A) the activities of the office or agency, or (B) matters

1		observed pursuant to duty imposed by law as to which
2		matters there was a duty to report, excluding,
3		however, in criminal cases matters observed by police
4		officers and other law enforcement personnel, or (C)
5		in civil proceedings and against the government in
6		criminal cases, factual findings resulting from an
7		investigation made pursuant to authority granted by
8		law, unless the sources of information or other
9		circumstances indicate lack of trustworthiness.
10	(9)	Records of vital statistics. Records or data
11		compilations, in any form, of births, fetal deaths,
12		deaths, or marriages, if the report thereof was made
13		to a public office pursuant to requirements of law.
14	(10)	Absence of public record or entry. To prove the
15		absence of a record, report, statement, or data
16		compilation, in any form, or the nonoccurrence or
17		nonexistence of a matter of which a record, report,
18		statement, or data compilation, in any form, was
19		regularly made and preserved by a public office or
20		agency, evidence in the form of a certification in
21		accordance with rule 902, or testimony, that diligent

1		search failed to disclose the record, report,
2		statement, or data compilation, or entry.
3	(11)	Records of religious organizations. Statements of
4		births, marriages, divorces, deaths, legitimacy,
5		ancestry, relationship by blood or marriage, or other
6		similar facts of personal or family history, contained
7		in a regularly kept record of a religious
8		organization.
9	(12)	Marriage, baptismal, and similar certificates.
10		Statements of fact contained in a certificate that the
11		maker performed a marriage or other ceremony or
12		administered a sacrament, made by a [elergyman,]
13		clergy, public official, or other person authorized by
14		the rules or practices of a religious organization or
15		by law to perform the act certified, and purporting to
16		have been issued at the time of the act or within a
17		reasonable time thereafter.
18	(13)	Family records. Statements of fact concerning
19		personal or family history contained in family Bibles,
20		genealogies, charts, engravings on rings, inscriptions

1	on family	portraits,	engravings	on	urns,	crypts,	or
2	tombstones	s, or the l	ike.				

- 3 (14) Records of documents affecting an interest in 4 property. The record of a document purporting to 5 establish or affect an interest in property, as proof of the content of the original recorded document and 7 its execution and delivery by each person by whom it 8 purports to have been executed, if the record is a 9 record of a public office and an applicable statute 10 authorizes the recording of documents of that kind in 11 that office.
- 12 (15) Statements in documents affecting an interest in
 13 property. A statement contained in a document
 14 purporting to establish or affect an interest in
 15 property if the matter stated was relevant to the
 16 purpose of the document, unless the circumstances
 17 indicate lack of trustworthiness.
- 18 (16) Statements in ancient documents. Statements in a document in existence twenty years or more the authenticity of which is established.

1	(1/)	Market reports, commercial publications. Market
2		quotations, tabulations, lists, directories, or other
3		published compilations, generally used and relied upor
4		by the public or by persons in particular occupations.
5	(18)	Learned treatises. To the extent called to the
6		attention of an expert witness upon cross-examination
7		or relied upon by the witness in direct examination,
8		statements contained in published treatises,
9		periodicals, or pamphlets on a subject of history,
10		medicine, or other science or art, established as a
11		reliable authority by the testimony or admission of
12		the witness or by other expert testimony or by
13		judicial notice. If admitted, the statements may be
14		read into evidence but [may] shall not be received as
15		exhibits.
16	(19)	Reputation concerning personal or family history.
17		Reputation among members of the person's family by
18		blood, adoption, or marriage, or among the person's
19		associates, or in the community, concerning a person's
20		$birth[\tau]_{\underline{i}}$ adoption $[\tau]_{\underline{i}}$ marriage $[\tau]_{\underline{i}}$ divorce $[\tau]_{\underline{i}}$
21		$death[\tau]$; $legitimacy[\tau]$; $relationship by blood,$

1		adoption, or marriage[τ]; ancestry[τ]; or other
2		similar fact of the person's personal or family
3		history.
4	(20)	Reputation concerning boundaries or general history.
5		Reputation in a community, arising before the
6		controversy, as to boundaries of or customs affecting
7		lands in the community, and reputation as to events of
8		general history important to the community $[\frac{\partial x}{\partial x}]_{\underline{t}}$
9		state, or nation in which located.
10	(21)	Reputation as to character. In proving character or a
11		trait of character under rules 404 and 405, reputation
12		of a person's character among the person's associates
13		or in the community.
14	(22)	Judgment of previous conviction. Evidence of a final
15		judgment, entered after a trial or upon a plea of
16		guilty [(but], but not upon a plea of nolo
17		contendere[+], adjudging a person guilty of a crime
18		punishable by death or imprisonment in excess of one
19		year, to prove any fact essential to sustain the
20		judgment, but not including, when offered by the
21		government in a criminal prosecution for purposes

1		other than impeachment, judgments against persons
2		other than the accused. The pendency of an appeal may
3		be shown but does not affect admissibility.
4	(23)	Judgment as to personal, family, or general history,
5		or boundaries. Judgments as proof of matters of
6		personal, family, or general history, or boundaries,
7		essential to the judgment, if the same would be
8		provable by evidence of reputation.
9	(24)	Statement by a victim of domestic violence.
10		(A) A statement that purports to narrate, describe,
11		report, or explain an incident of domestic
12		violence, as defined in section 321-471, made by
13		a victim of that domestic violence during the
14		course of the first interaction with the
15		responding law enforcement officers as defined in
16		section 139-1 and before the defendant is
17		arrested, regardless of the availability of the
18		declarant, if the statement has sufficient
19		indicia of reliability; provided that the
20		statement shall not be admissible if, when
21		objectively considered, the primary purpose of

1	<u>t</u>	he statement was not to enable assistance to
2	<u>m</u>	eet an ongoing emergency, including any
3	<u>s</u>	tatement given at a later time or any statement
4	<u>m</u>	ade solely for the purpose of producing trial
5	<u>e</u>	vidence.
6	<u>(B)</u> <u>I</u>	n determining whether a statement has sufficient
7	<u>i</u>	ndicia of reliability, the court shall consider
8	<u>a</u>	ll circumstances surrounding the statement. In
9	<u>d</u>	etermining whether a statement has sufficient
10	<u>i</u>	ndicia of reliability, the court may consider:
11	_(i) The personal knowledge of the declarant;
12	<u>(i</u>	i) Whether the statement is corroborated by
13		evidence other than statements that are
14		subject to admission only pursuant to this
15		paragraph, if the evidence exists;
16	<u>(</u> ii	i) The timing of the statement; and
17	<u>(i</u>	v) Whether the statement was elicited by
18		leading questions.
19	Recant	ation by a declarant is not a sufficient reason
20	for de	nying admission of a statement under this

1		parag	raph in the absence of other factors indicating
2		unrel	iability.
3	[(24)]	(25)	Other exceptions. A statement not specifically
4		cover	ed by any of the exceptions in this [paragraph
5		(b)]	subsection but having equivalent circumstantial
6		guara	ntees of trustworthiness, if the court determines
7		that:	
8		(A)	[the] The statement is more probative on the
9			point for which it is offered than any other
10			evidence [which] that the proponent can procure
11			through reasonable efforts[$ au$]; and
12		(B)	[the] The general purposes of these rules and the
13			interests of justice will best be served by
14			admission of the statement into evidence.
15		Howev	er, a statement [may] shall not be admitted under
16		this	exception unless the proponent of it makes known
17		to th	e adverse party sufficiently in advance of the
18		trial	or hearing to provide the adverse party with a
19		fair	opportunity to prepare to meet it, the
20		propo	nent's intention to offer the statement and the

1 particulars of it, including the name and address of 2 the declarant." 3 SECTION 3. This Act does not affect rights and duties that matured, penalties that were incurred, and proceedings that were 4 5 begun before its effective date. 6 SECTION 4. Statutory material to be repealed is bracketed 7 and stricken. New statutory material is underscored. 8 SECTION 5. This Act shall take effect on July 1, 3021.

Report Title:

Rules of Evidence; Hearsay Exceptions; Domestic Violence

Description:

Allows a narrow hearsay exception for statements made by domestic violence victims during the course of the first interaction with the responding law enforcement officers and before the arrest of the defendant, as long as the statement bears sufficient indicia of reliability. Effective 7/1/3021. (HD1)

The summary description of legislation appearing on this page is for informational purposes only and is not legislation or evidence of legislative intent.