

DAVID Y. IGE GOVERNOR



RUSSELL A. SUZUKI ATTORNEY GENERAL

STATE OF HAWAII DEPARTMENT OF THE ATTORNEY GENERAL

DANA O. VIOLA FIRST DEPUTY ATTORNEY GENERAL

425 QUEEN STREET HONOLULU, HAWAII 96813 (808) 586-1500

December 27, 2018

The Honorable Ronald D. Kouchi President of the Senate and Members of the Senate Thirtieth State Legislature State Capitol, Room 409 Honolulu, Hawaii 96813 The Honorable Scott K. Saiki
Speaker and Members of the House of
Representatives
Thirtieth State Legislature
State Capitol, Room 431
Honolulu, Hawaii 96813

Dear President Kouchi and Speaker Saiki:

For your information and consideration, I am transmitting one (1) copy for each of you of the Department of the Attorney General's <u>Annual Report on the Tobacco Enforcement Special Fund as required by section 28-15(d)</u>, <u>Hawaii Revised Statutes (HRS)</u>. In accordance with Section 93-16, HRS, I am also informing you that the report may be viewed electronically at http://ag.hawaii.gov/publications/reports/reports-to-the-legislature/.

If you have any questions or concerns, please feel free to call me at 586-1282.

Sincerely,

Russell A. Suzuki Attorney General

Cursella Sur

c: David Y. Ige, Governor
Josh Green, Lieutenant Governor
Legislative Reference Bureau (Attn.: Karen Mau)
Leslie Kondo, State Auditor
Laurel A. Johnston, Director of Finance, Department of Budget and Finance
Stacey A. Aldrich, State Librarian, Hawaii State Public Library System
David Lassner, PhD., President, University of Hawaii

Enclosure



RUSSELL A. SUZUKI ATTORNEY GENERAL

DANA O. VIOLA FIRST DEPUTY ATTORNEY GENERAL

STATE OF HAWAII DEPARTMENT OF THE ATTORNEY GENERAL

425 QUEEN STREET HONOLULU, HAWAII 96813 (808) 586-1500

REPORT ON THE TOBACCO ENFORCEMENT SPECIAL FUND

Pursuant to Section 28-15(d), Hawaii Revised Statutes

Fiscal Year 2017 - 2018

Submitted to the Thirtieth State Legislature Regular Session of 2019

I.	INTE	RODUCTION	2
11.	TOB	ACCO MASTER SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT	2
	A. B. C. D. E.	Background Master Settlement Agreement Payments Tobacco Liability Act (Chapter 675, HRS) Enforcement Diligent Enforcement Arbitration	2 2 4 5 7
III.	CIG	ARETTE TAX AND TOBACCO TAX LAW (Chapter 245, HRS)	7
	A. B. C. D. E. F. G.	Background Cigarette Tax Revenues Enforcement Gray Market Counterfeit Tax Stamps Half-Stamping Sales by Internet and Mail	7 8 9 10 10 10
IV.	FY 2	017-2018 DEPOSITS TO TOBACCO ENFORCEMENT SPECIAL D	11
V.	FY 2	017-2018 APPROPRIATIONS AND EXPENDITURES	11

I. INTRODUCTION

Section 28-15(d), Hawaii Revised Statutes (HRS), requires the Department of the Attorney General to submit a report to the Legislature, no later than twenty days prior to the convening of each regular session, providing an accounting of the receipts and expenditures of the Tobacco Enforcement Special Fund.

On July 1, 2000, the Department's Tobacco Enforcement Unit (the Unit) was created to enforce the Tobacco Master Settlement Agreement, the state Tobacco Liability Act, and the state Cigarette Tax and Tobacco Tax Law. The Unit is composed of a unit supervisor, a Master Settlement Agreement civil prosecutor, a cigarette tax prosecutor, seven criminal investigators, a legal assistant, and a legal clerk.

II. TOBACCO MASTER SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT

A. Background

On November 23, 1998, leading United States tobacco manufacturers entered into the Tobacco Master Settlement Agreement with forty-six states, including Hawaii. In consideration for a release of past, present, and certain future claims against them, the Master Settlement Agreement obligates these manufacturers to pay substantial sums to the settling states (tied in part to the volume of tobacco product sales). The Attorney General of each settling state is responsible for enforcing the provisions of the Tobacco Master Settlement Agreement (hereinafter "Master Settlement Agreement" or "MSA").

B. Master Settlement Agreement Payments

There are three types of Master Settlement Agreement payments:

(1) Initial Payments to Hawaii were received annually from January 10, 1999, through January 10, 2003.

Year		Amount of Initial Payment
1999-2000		27,804,177.13
2000-2001		11,659,558.77
2001-2002		12,701,627.03
2002-2003		<u>12,864,378.74</u>
	Total	\$ 65,029,741.67

(2) Annual Payments to Hawaii began on April 15, 2000, and are scheduled to be received on April 15 of each year in perpetuity.

Year		Amount of Annual Payment
1999-2000		20,811,042.90
2000-2001		24,471,822.21
2001-2002		32,674,220.28
2002-2003		31,845,690.90
2003-2004		37,793,157.48
2004-2005		38,357,998.54
2005-2006		35,212,822.31
2006-2007		36,857,166.01
2007-2008		37,299,996.79
2008-2009		41,132,845.88
2009-2010		34,230,792.73
2010-2011		32,453,603.85
2011-2012		33,096,749.95
2012-2013		33,073,205.78
2013-2014		37,420,086.29
2014-2015		32,022,781.47
2015-2016		33,654,568.07
2016-2017		33,211,083.41
2017-2018		<u>26,149,213.01</u>
	Total	\$631,768,847.86

(3) Strategic Contribution Payments to Hawaii began on April 15, 2008, and are scheduled to be received on April 15 of each year through 2017.

<u>Year</u>		Amount of Strategic Contribution
		Payment
2007-2008		18,762,802.27
2008-2009		19,225,534.21
2009-2010		16,691,299.06
2010-2011		15,211,574.73
2011-2012		15,492,087.49
2012-2013		15,505,806.17
2013-2014		15,238,278.95
2014-2015		15,206,293.27
2015-2016		15,612,254.40
2016-2017		<u> 15,538,756.05</u>
	Total	\$162,484,686.60

In fiscal year (FY) 2017-2018, the State received \$26,149,213.01 in Master Settlement Agreement moneys. The State also received \$58,600,584.78 as part of a negotiated settlement that resolved the 2004 Diligent Enforcement Arbitration and

settled Diligent Enforcement Arbitrations through 2017. The amount of the settlement totaled \$84,749,797.79.

The total amounts of Master Settlement Agreement payments received by Hawaii as of the end of FY 2016-2017 are as follows:

Initial Payments	65,029,741.67
Annual Payments	631,768,847.86
Strategic Contribution Payments	162,484,686.60
2004 Diligent Enforcement Arbitration	58,600,584.78
Settlement of 2004 to 2017 Diligent	
Enforcement Arbitration issues	

Total:

\$ 917,883,860.91

C. Tobacco Liability Act (Chapter 675, HRS)

The Master Settlement Agreement requires the State to diligently enforce the requirements of the "model statute," which was enacted as the Tobacco Liability Act. The Master Settlement Agreement and the Tobacco Liability Act represent affirmative steps toward holding tobacco manufacturers accountable for the harm caused by the sale of cigarettes to residents of Hawaii. Section 675-1(d), HRS, provides:

It is the policy of the State that financial burdens imposed on the State by cigarette smoking be borne by tobacco product manufacturers rather than by the State to the extent that such manufacturers either determine to enter into a settlement with the State or are found culpable by the courts.

Section 675-1(f), HRS, provides:

It would be contrary to the policy of the State if tobacco product manufacturers who determine not to enter into such a settlement could use a resulting cost advantage to derive large, short-term profits It is thus in the interest of the State to require that such manufacturers establish a reserve fund to guarantee a source of compensation and to prevent such manufacturers from deriving large, short-term profits and then becoming judgment-proof before liability may arise.

The Tobacco Liability Act requires any tobacco product manufacturer selling cigarettes to consumers in Hawaii – whether directly or through a distributor, retailer, or similar intermediary or intermediaries – to either participate in and perform its financial obligations under the Master Settlement Agreement, or place funds in an escrow account to establish a reserve fund to guarantee a source of compensation to the State if the tobacco product manufacturer is found culpable by the courts. A non-participating

manufacturer (NPM) is a tobacco product manufacturer who has not entered into the Master Settlement Agreement.

NPMs who fail to comply with the escrow requirements enjoy a price advantage over those who comply. This price advantage lures consumers away from and decreases the market share of participating manufacturers. In a recent Master Settlement Agreement disbursement, the amounts due to the states were reduced because of a national increase in NPM market share.

D. Enforcement

Failure to diligently enforce the Tobacco Liability Act may result in a state losing a significant portion of its Master Settlement Agreement payments. "Diligent enforcement" in the context of the Master Settlement Agreement enforcement had not been clearly defined, and was the subject of a lengthy arbitration for the calendar year 2003, which had its beginnings in 2010 and concluded in 2013. In the 2003 Arbitration, the panel concluded that diligent enforcement was an ongoing and intentional consideration of the requirements of a Settling State's Qualifying Statute, and a significant attempt by a Settling State to meet those requirements, taking into account a Settling State's competing laws and policies that may conflict with its MSA contractual obligations. The factors considered by the 2003 panel included: collection rate, lawsuits filed, gathering reliable data, resources allocated to enforcement, preventing noncompliant NPMs from future sales, legislation enacted, actions short of legislation, and efforts to be aware of National Association of Attorneys General and other states' enforcement efforts.

The 2003 arbitration panel on the issue of what constitutes "Units Sold" determined that, "as a matter of law", that the model statute definition of "Units Sold" is unambiguous and binding." "Units Sold" is defined in Exhibit T to the MSA as follows:

"Units Sold" means the number of individual cigarettes sold in the State by the applicable tobacco product manufacturer (whether directly or through a distributor, retailer or similar intermediary or intermediaries) during the year in question, as measured by excise taxes collected by the State on packs (or "roll-your-own" tobacco containers) bearing the excise tax stamp of the State [Emphasis added.]

Simply put, the 2003 Arbitration panel held that a state's obligation to collect escrow was limited to those NPM cigarettes, which could be measured by packs bearing the excise tax stamp of a state.

Hawaii's diligent enforcement efforts and regulatory scheme includes identifying NPMs and the number of NPM cigarettes sold in Hawaii in each calendar year; notifying NPMs of their obligation to establish and fund an escrow in accordance with chapter 675; and as necessary filing complaints in court against NPMs who fail to comply with

chapter 675. Simply put, the Department has developed a system that:

- (1) Identifies NPMs and their products;
- (2) Gathers and tracks information on NPM products;
- (3) Notifies NPMs of their obligations under the Tobacco Liability Act and under chapter 486P, HRS, and related statutes (the Department sends letters to tobacco product manufacturers worldwide to advise them of these obligations);
- (4) Provides assistance to effectuate compliance;
- (5) Has provided the relevant information, that has allowed the Attorney General to file lawsuits as necessary to compel compliance with the escrow statutes; and
- (6) Provides the information-gathering and certification protocols necessary to establish and publish the directory of tobacco product manufacturers whose cigarettes and Roll-Your-Own (RYO) tobacco products are authorized for sale in Hawaii.

In 2003, the Unit created a directory of compliant cigarettes and RYO tobacco products. The directory has been posted on the Department's website since October 31, 2003, and was revised and updated in FY 2017-2018. At the end of FY 2017-2018, 24 compliant tobacco product manufacturers (20 participating manufacturers and 4 NPMs) were listed in the directory, along with a list of 106 authorized brands of cigarettes and RYO tobacco products.

Further, the directory in conjunction with the Tobacco Products Reporting statutes (chapter 486P, HRS) facilitates the time-consuming process of identifying individual manufacturers and their respective brands. When a tobacco product manufacturer is identified as having or intending to have sales in Hawaii, the Unit notifies the tobacco product manufacturer that it must comply with chapter 486P, including the requirement to register with the Department pursuant to section 486P-5, HRS.

The Unit provides a reporting form to wholesalers and distributors, and gathers information from the responses and invoices submitted by the wholesalers and distributors. Based on this information, the Unit verifies that only compliant NPMs and their brands are sold (directly or through distributors, retailers, or similar intermediaries) in Hawaii. In addition, the Unit verifies that only compliant NPMs and their authorized brands are stamped and sold in Hawaii by investigating cigarette brands on store shelves.

The Unit sends formal demands to NPMs that have sales in Hawaii, requiring that they place appropriate sums in a qualified escrow fund in compliance with the Tobacco Liability Act. In FY 2017-2018, while four NPMs were listed in the directory, only two NPMs had severely reduced sales in Hawaii. The total number of cigarettes or RYO totaled 4,103 of units sold. The two NPMs deposited the required aggregate total

of \$138.45 into their respective qualified escrow funds – a compliance rate of 100 percent.

E. 2004 Diligent Enforcement Arbitration

As noted above, failure to diligently enforce the Tobacco Liability Act may result in a state losing a significant portion of its Master Settlement Agreement payments. After nearly two years of pretrial litigation and extensive discovery the Participating Manufacturers affirmatively challenged the State of Hawaii's Diligent Enforcement for the calendar year 2004. The State of Hawaii's Arbitration was scheduled to begin in August of 2018. With the assistance of outside counsel the State reached a Settlement with the Tobacco industry, on March 6, 2018, which resolved the Diligent Enforcement Arbitration Issues for the years 2004 through and including 2017. The Settlement spared the State the cost and uncertainty of ongoing and protracted arbitrations. It was estimated that had the matter gone to arbitration it could have cost the State approximately \$1.5 million dollars in litigation costs. Had the State prevailed in the 2004 Diligent Enforcement Arbitration, Hawaii would have received \$4,648,059.24, the amount withheld by the industry from the industry's 2004 payment to Hawaii, plus any interest that accrued on the withheld amount.

As mentioned above, the State of Hawaii reached an agreement with the Tobacco Industry that settled the Diligent Enforcement Arbitration Disputes for the years 2004 through and including 2017. The Settlement amount of \$58,600,584.78 was received by the State on April 19, 2018. Outside Litigation costs totaled approximately \$189,000.00.

III. CIGARETTE TAX AND TOBACCO TAX LAW (Chapter 245, HRS)

A. Background

In 2000, the Legislature recognized the need for a mandatory cigarette tax stamp system "to assess, collect, and enforce the cigarette and tobacco tax." The Conference Committee on S.B. No. 2486, S.D. 2, H.D. 2, C.D. 1 (2000) (Act 249, Session Laws of Hawaii 2000), reported:

[E]nforcement of the current system of collecting cigarette and tobacco taxes is sporadic, haphazard, and ineffective, resulting in uncollected potential tax revenue. The current system of filing of returns by licensed dealers is in effect a system of voluntary compliance. Persons may try to sell cigarettes and tobacco products without obtaining a license, or could have a license and not file a return or understate the income on the return.

The Legislature recognized that obtaining proof of large-scale black market cigarette sales is nearly impossible because the activity is surreptitious and the State's resources are limited. Nonetheless, the Legislature concluded, "judging from the anecdotal evidence existing and continuing over a fifteen-year period that a black market exists." With these concerns in mind, chapter 245 was amended by Act 249 to require that the tax on the sale or use of cigarettes under section 245-3, HRS, shall be paid by licensees through the use of stamps. Beginning on January 1, 2001, a licensee or its authorized agent or designee is required to affix a stamp to the bottom of each individual package of cigarettes prior to distribution. Beginning on April 1, 2001, no individual package of cigarettes shall be sold or offered for sale to the public unless affixed with the stamp as required by chapter 245. Beginning in 2000, the Unit worked closely with licensed wholesalers and dealers and the Department of Taxation to facilitate the implementation of the cigarette stamp program. In January 2001, the Unit began conducting inspections for compliance with the program.

In 2005, the Attorney General proposed a bill to amend chapter 245 to require a permit for the retail sale of cigarettes and other tobacco products, and to require retailers to keep adequate records. These amendments became effective on December 1, 2006 (Act 131, Session Laws of Hawaii 2005). The Retail Tobacco Permit program addresses the problem of cigarettes and other tobacco products being imported to Hawaii by entities other than known wholesalers and distributors; for example, consumers and retail stores often order cigarettes by Internet, telephone, or mail. The record-keeping requirements of the Retail Tobacco Permit program help law enforcement officers determine the sources of cigarettes and other tobacco products sold at retail, and thus help prevent evasion of state taxes.

B. Cigarette Tax Revenues

Since the implementation of the tax stamp program on January 1, 2001, cigarette tax revenues have increased significantly. Cigarette tax revenues increased from \$40,049,539 in FY 1999-2000 to \$51,739,469 in FY 2000-2001 (an increase of \$11,689,930 or approximately 29 percent) even though the tax stamp program was in effect for only half of FY 2000-2001 and effective enforcement began at the retail level only three months before the end of FY 2000-2001. In FY 2017-2018, the Department of Taxation reported cigarette tax collections of \$110,762,990.55.

Cigarette Tax Revenues by Fiscal Year

FY 1999-2000	\$ 40,049,539
FY 2000-2001	\$ 51,739,469
FY 2001-2002	\$ 62,609,477
FY 2002-2003	\$ 70,586,392
FY 2003-2004	\$ 77,541,843
FY 2004-2005	\$ 83,135,360
FY 2005-2006	\$ 85,702,483

FY 2006-2007	\$ 88,771,666
FY 2007-2008	\$ 101,560,051
FY 2008-2009	\$ 104,433,576
FY 2009-2010	\$ 119,926,741
FY 2010-2011	\$ 135,647,918
FY 2011-2012	\$ 130,994,721
FY 2012-2013	\$ 120,095,909
FY 2013-2014	\$ 114,112,465
FY 2014-2015	\$ 121,629,882
FY 2015-2016	\$ 116,382,902
FY 2016-2017	\$ 114,926,266
FY 2017-2018	\$ 110,762,991

C. Enforcement

The Unit conducts inspections, including unannounced inspections, of wholesalers and distributors, retail establishments, and cigarette vending machines for compliance with the Cigarette Tax and Tobacco Tax Law. 1,343 retailers hold Retail Tobacco Permits: 845 on Oahu, 210 on Hawaii, 185 on Maui, 95 on Kauai, 4 on Molokai, 4 on Lanai. Inspections have been conducted on all of these islands.

- In FY 2017-2018, 1,599 compliance inspections were conducted statewide:
 1,315 on Oahu, 126 on the island of Hawaii, 75 on Kauai, 69 on Maui, 14 on Molokai.
- Since April 1, 2001, enforcement activities have resulted in more than 160 felony arrests, numerous investigations, and seizure of more than 3,144,228 illegal cigarettes and 104.8 pounds of tobacco leaves. Historically, arrests have been made on Hawaii, Kauai, Maui, Molokai, and Oahu.
- In FY 2017-2018, 28 criminal tobacco investigations were conducted and 389 cartons and 12 packs of cigarettes (the equivalent of 78,040 cigarettes) and 23 pounds of tobacco leaves were seized at the Honolulu International Airport (9 investigations) and at the U.S. Post Office (19 investigations), as a result of cooperative efforts between the Department, United States Customs and Border Protection, and the U.S. Postal Service.
- Since April 1, 2001, the Unit has prosecuted 139 tobacco cases, resulting in criminal fines of \$197,600.
- In total, 75 cigarette prosecutions have resulted in court-ordered forfeiture of cigarettes. In addition, the Department has secured 99 civil administration forfeiture orders for, or stipulations or agreements to, the forfeiture of confiscated cigarettes.

D. Gray Market

Gray market cigarettes are American-made or foreign-made cigarettes – usually major American brands – sold by the manufacturers specifically for sale outside of the United States. Gray market cigarettes cut into the market share of participating manufacturers. Gray market cigarettes include cigarettes that have been imported illegally into the United States in violation of federal law, fail to meet federally mandated labeling requirements, or bear an unauthorized brand or trademark and are considered contraband. Foreign-made gray market cigarettes are manufactured overseas in such places as China, Colombia, the Philippines, Southeast Asia, and Switzerland, representing a multitude of brands and cigarette manufacturers. These cigarettes are often smuggled into Hawaii from Asia, the Philippines, Southeast Asia, and the South Pacific, and have been found in small grocery and liquor stores. Some mainland distributors attempt to mask or re-label "Tax Exempt" cigarettes to avoid prosecution for sale of gray market cigarettes.

Historically, to address the gray market and other contraband cigarette problem, the Department has established relationships and has shared information with the taxing and regulatory authorities of Alaska, Arizona, California, Florida, Michigan, Oregon, Utah, Vermont, Washington, and Canada. The Department has also historically coordinated with the Bureau of Alcohol, Tobacco, Firearms, and Explosives; Internal Revenue Service; United States Customs and Border Protection; United States Postal Service; and Royal Canadian Mounted Police with regard to gray market cigarettes and other contraband cigarette-related issues.

The Department has worked with United States Customs and Border Protection in joint investigations of persons smuggling contraband cigarettes to Hawaii from foreign countries. This cooperative effort has resulted 5 investigations of individuals attempting to bring undeclared or under-declared cigarettes to Hawaii in FY 2017-2018. Gray market and other contraband cigarettes have been seized at airports in these joint interdiction efforts.

E. Counterfeit Tax Stamps

Counterfeit tax stamps cost as little as \$0.03 to \$0.50 per stamp and, therefore, create a significant price advantage over vendors who sell properly stamped cigarettes. The Department searches for counterfeit Hawaii tax stamps in order to prevent their circulation.

F. Half-Stamping

Historically vendors have attempted to evade the cigarette tax by placing a half-stamp on the bottom of a package of cigarettes, thus stamping two packs for the price of one. Investigations have resulted in arrests for selling half-stamped or partially stamped packs. In November 2001, the Unit made arrests for half-stamping and seized

12,879 packs, of which 2,639 packs were half-stamped and 10,240 packs were unstamped. The Unit continues to ensure that the application of tax stamps conforms with the stamping requirements set forth by rules adopted by the Department of Taxation¹.

G. Sales by Internet and Mail

Efforts continue in Hawaii and across the nation to address the problem of Internet sales of cigarettes. Significant federal regulation in the form of the Prevent All Cigarette Trafficking Act of 2009 (PACT ACT²) was passed in March 2010. In FY 2017-2018, the Tobacco Unit also initiated 14 investigations into Craigslist offerings and 10 investigations into OfferUp offerings for the sale of tobacco products without a tobacco retail permit within the State of Hawaii. The investigations resulted in the Craigslist and OfferUp listings being removed from Craigslist and OfferUp within a day or two of the investigations being initiated.

As noted above, interdiction activities also took place in conjunction with United States Customs and the U.S. Postal Service where parcels of cigarettes and loose tobacco were seized as prohibited mailed items and treated as contraband in violation of the PACT ACT.

IV. FY 2017-2018 DEPOSITS TO TOBACCO ENFORCEMENT SPECIAL FUND

Master Settlement Agreement funds

350,000

11

Cigarette tax stamp fees/interest/fines/misc.

1.749.769

Total: \$2,099,769

V. FY 2017-2018 APPROPRIATIONS AND EXPENDITURES

In FY 2017-2018, there was a total appropriation of \$1,364,642 for Master Settlement Agreement and cigarette tax stamp enforcement. The appropriation was funded in part by \$350,000 from moneys received from the Master Settlement Agreement and \$1,749,769 from cigarette tax stamp fees.

Expenses for FY 2017-2018 totaled \$1,306,720 which leaves an appropriation balance of \$57,922.

² 18 U.S.C. § 1716E (2010).

¹ Title 18, Hawaii Administrative Rules, section 18-245-3 provides that stamps or stamping indicia shall be securely affixed to the bottom of each cigarette package in such a manner that the stamps or stamping indicia are clearly visible, legible, and complete.

TOBACCO ENFORCEMENT SPECIAL FUND Fiscal Year 2017-2018

			<u> </u>
APPROPRIATION			\$1,364,642.00
PERSONNEL COSTS		1,030,044.00	
Salaries and Fringe			
OPERATIONAL EXPENSES & OVERHEAD COSTS			
Supplies	2,204.00		
Membership Dues and Subscriptions	1,545.00		
Postage	1,000.00		
Telephone	5,935.00		
Mileage	5,126.00		
Travel Costs	12,900.00		
Data Service	4,816.00		
Lease Rent	101,438.00		
Rental of Equipment	7,703.00		
Miscellaneous Expenses	10,253.00		
Special Fund Assessments paid to B&F	77,886.00		
Special Fund Assessments for AG Department	45,870.00		
TOTAL		276,676.00	
TOTAL COSTS			\$1,306,720.00
APPROPRIATION BALANCE			\$57,922.00