



**TESTIMONY OF  
THE DEPARTMENT OF THE ATTORNEY GENERAL  
TWENTY-SEVENTH LEGISLATURE, 2014**

---

**ON THE FOLLOWING MEASURE:**

H.B. NO. 493, H.D. 1, S.D. 1, RELATING TO ANIMAL CRUELTY.

**BEFORE THE:**

SENATE COMMITTEE ON WAYS AND MEANS



**DATE:** Friday, March 28, 2014

**TIME:** 9:25 a.m.

**LOCATION:** State Capitol, Room 211

**TESTIFIER(S): WRITTEN TESTIMONY ONLY** (For more information please contact Simeona A. Mariano, Deputy Attorney General, at 586-1160)

---

Chair Ige and Members of the Committee:

The Department of the Attorney General (Department) provides the following comments.

The purposes of this bill are to:

1. Establish the offense of unlawful sale or trade of ivory products for persons who unlawfully sell, offer to sell, or possess with intent to sell any ivory product;
2. Create exemptions for the sale or trade of certain ivory products provided that the seller can demonstrate that the ivory products meet specific requirements; and
3. Provide that the disposition of seized ivory products shall be subject to forfeiture pursuant to chapter 712A of the Hawaii Revised Statutes.

On page 7, beginning at line 9, the bill establishes the offense of unlawful sale or trade of ivory products. The Department is concerned that the offense is created in one section of law and identified by one name, but is proposed to include two different grades of the offense, a misdemeanor and a class C felony, with the only difference being whether or not the offender has a prior conviction for the same offense. Because the two grades of the offense fall under one statutory section, it may create confusion and make it difficult to distinguish between the two grades of the offense in the Hawaii Criminal Justice Information System, which tracks the criminal histories of offenders.

The Department suggests that either a different section be created for each grade of offense (i.e., first and second degree), or the offense be limited to a single grade of offense (a misdemeanor or a class C felony), and enhanced sentencing provisions be used to address subsequent or multiple convictions.

The Department's second concern is regarding the forfeiture provision on page 10 of the bill, at lines 7-12. The bill provides for the forfeiture of the seized ivory products pursuant to chapter 712A, upon conviction or other entry of judgment. The administrative forfeiture process under chapter 712A, Hawaii Revised Statutes, is not based upon, or triggered by, a conviction or judgment. Instead, a law enforcement officer may initiate forfeiture process based upon probable cause to believe that the property is subject to forfeiture. Thus, the requirement of a conviction or entry of judgment in order to forfeit the seized ivory appears inconsistent with the forfeiture provisions of chapter 712A.

NEIL ABERCROMBIE  
GOVERNOR OF HAWAII



**STATE OF HAWAII  
DEPARTMENT OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES**

POST OFFICE BOX 621  
HONOLULU, HAWAII 96809

**Testimony of  
WILLIAM J. AILA, JR.  
Chairperson**

**Before the Senate Committee on  
WAYS AND MEANS**

**Friday, March 28, 2014  
9:25 AM  
State Capitol, Conference Room 211**

**In consideration of  
HOUSE BILL 493, HOUSE DRAFT 1, SENATE DRAFT 1  
RELATING TO ANIMAL CRUELTY**

House Bill 493, House Draft 1, Senate Draft 1 proposes to amend the Hawaii Revised Statutes by adding a new chapter titled “Unlawful Sale or Trade of Ivory Products”, whereby the import, sale, offering for sale, or possession with intent to sell (including internet sales) any ivory product is prohibited. The 1<sup>st</sup> violation for such an offense would be a misdemeanor, and the second offense or subsequent offenses would be class C felonies. **The Department of Land and Natural Resources (Department) strongly supports this bill.**

African elephants are spiraling toward extinction as illegal poaching and ivory trade continue to decimate their numbers. Tusks are traded internationally and sold world-wide, often after being carved into trinkets and then being identified as some other animal tusk, or claimed as a “pre-act” tusk, meaning that it had been harvested before the 1990 international treaty (CITES) which made ivory trade illegal in many countries. In 2008, the Humane Society’s investigative report concluded that the United States was the second largest ivory market in the world. Hawaii is the third largest retail ivory market in the United States after California and New York. The 2008 report estimated that 90% of the ivory for sale in Hawaii was imported illegally or of unknown origin.

Without laboratory analysis, it is impossible to identify ivory as to its age or even the animal type, especially if the ivory has already been carved. Fraudulent documents are frequently used to claim the ivory is pre-1990 origin, or of another species. The Department believes that the extinction of these magnificent animals is imminent if we do not halt the ivory trade by passing these laws.

**WILLIAM J. AILA, JR.**  
CHAIRPERSON  
BOARD OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES  
COMMISSION ON WATER RESOURCE MANAGEMENT

**JESSE K. SOUKI**  
FIRST DEPUTY

**WILLIAM M. TAM**  
DEPUTY DIRECTOR - WATER

AQUATIC RESOURCES  
BOATING AND OCEAN RECREATION  
BUREAU OF CONVEYANCES  
COMMISSION ON WATER RESOURCE MANAGEMENT  
CONSERVATION AND COASTAL LANDS  
CONSERVATION AND RESOURCES ENFORCEMENT  
ENGINEERING  
FORESTRY AND WILDLIFE  
HISTORIC PRESERVATION  
KAHOOLAWE ISLAND RESERVE COMMISSION  
LAND  
STATE PARKS

From: [ElephantsNJ](#)  
To: [WAM Testimony](#)  
Subject: WAM 3-28-14, SUPPORT FOR HB 493 SD1; RELATING TO ANIMAL CRUELTY; IVORY SALES  
Date: Thursday, March 27, 2014 7:06:12 AM

---

*Dear Chair Ige,*

*I am the mother of two beautiful girls, age five. I am deeply concerned over the hunger in the United States for ivory and I have joined a People's Movement calling for the end of the ivory trade within the United States. The ivory trade is an unacceptable, bloody, and morally bankrupt trade that is causing the demise – the extinction – of the earth's magnificent elephants. We must rise above this. Ivory has no place in a modern, evolved society. The ivory trade is wrought with greed, corruption, selfishness and it is a source of great funding for terrorism.*

*Please, Chari Ige, **I implore you to stand firm and strong for bill HB 493 SD1.** The fact that the opposition is so great from such a small percentage of people just furthers my conviction that we must, in good moral and human consciousness, outlaw this bloody, cruel trade, and send it to the history books forever! I guarantee that the number of parents in the great state of Hawaii and in the United States who want our children to grow up in a world with elephants far surpasses those who profit and benefit from such a grotesque trade.*

*Hawaii has the chance to be real heroes, true champions, for our national security, for the earth, for the elephants, and for our children. **Please support HB 493 SD1** to finally END the Aloha's state contribution to this horrific trade.*

*Thank you kindly for your consideration.*

*Barbara A. Peterson*

*Director ElephantsNJ, proud partner of ElephantsDC*

[www.elephantsDC.org](http://www.elephantsDC.org)

*Mom to Kate and Karly*

*Westwood, New Jersey  
[201.722.2814](tel:201.722.2814) (h) [201.602.4311](tel:201.602.4311) (c)*





**TO: Honorable Senator David Ige, Chair, Hawaii Senate Ways and Means Committee**  
**FROM: Elly Pepper, Wildlife Advocate, Natural Resources Defense Council**  
**DATE: March 26, 2014**  
**RE: Support for HB 493 SD1 – Hawaii Senate Ways and Means Committee Hearing on 3/28 at 9:25am**

---

On behalf of our 1.3 million members and activists, including more than 2,500 in Hawaii, we are writing to urge the Senate Ways and Means Committee to support House Bill 493 Senate Draft 1, which would prohibit the importation, sale, offer for sale, and possession with intent to sell, of any ivory product (teeth or tusks) from any species of wildlife in the majority of circumstances. The Natural Resources Defense Council is a national not-for-profit environmental organization.

The international trade in wildlife is a powerful political and economic force that has driven many species to the brink of extinction and some to disappear forever.<sup>1</sup> A dramatic and likely catastrophic example is the sharp rise in poaching of black rhino for Asian traditional medicines, which has played a huge role in reducing populations from several hundred thousand to around 4,838 and led to the extinction of the West African subspecies in 2013.<sup>2</sup> The trade in tiger bones for Chinese medicine, along with other factors, has reduced tiger populations by 97% from about 100,000 at the turn of the 20th century to 3,200 today, with three subspecies (Bali, Javan, and Caspian) driven to extinction by the 1980s, and one – the Sumatran tiger – with only 400 remaining individuals.<sup>3</sup>

As these cases and others have shown, the rarer a species gets, the more people desire them due to the economic and psychological values they attach to rarity—something a 2006 study referred to as the anthropogenic Allee effect.<sup>4</sup> According to this study, as long as there is a positive correlation between a species' rarity and its value, and the market price exceeds the cost of harvesting a species, harvesting will cause further declines, making species even rarer and more expensive, which in turn stimulates even more harvesting until there's nothing left.<sup>5</sup> Since buyers

---

<sup>1</sup> Duncan Graham-Rowe, *Biodiversity: Endangered and In Demand*. Nature 480:S101-S103 (2011).

<sup>2</sup> World Wildlife Fund, Black rhinoceros, [http://wwf.panda.org/what\\_we\\_do/endangered\\_species/rhinoceros/african\\_rhinos/black\\_rhinoceros/](http://wwf.panda.org/what_we_do/endangered_species/rhinoceros/african_rhinos/black_rhinoceros/); IUCN Red List, [www.iucnredlist.org](http://www.iucnredlist.org).

<sup>3</sup> World Wildlife Fund, Tiger Population, [http://wwf.panda.org/what\\_we\\_do/endangered\\_species/tigers/about\\_tigers/tiger\\_population/](http://wwf.panda.org/what_we_do/endangered_species/tigers/about_tigers/tiger_population/).

<sup>4</sup> Franck Courchamp, et al., *Rarity value and species extinction: The anthropogenic Allee effect*. PLoS Biology 4(12): e415 (2006).

<sup>5</sup> Id.; see also Liza Gross, *A Human Taste for Rarity Spells Disaster for Endangered Species*. PLoS Biology 4(12) (2006), doi:10.1371/journal.pbio.0040439.

are willing to pay any price to obtain these status symbols (e.g., \$22,000 per pound of rhino horn; \$1,300 per pound of ivory), the market price typically covers the cost of harvesting. This is particularly true for species whose parts are actually being used as luxury items, like elephants and rhinos, since the buyer's entire reason for purchasing them is to display wealth and/or social status. The rarer the item, the more expensive it becomes, and the more prestige the buyer gains by acquiring it.<sup>6</sup>

This is exactly what has happened with elephant ivory. As demand for ivory has boomed over the past five years, ivory prices have skyrocketed. This is particularly true in China where the market for illegal ivory has accelerated at the same time that household consumption expenditure (i.e., amount spent on goods and services per household) has increased. Between 2002 and 2004, the wholesale price paid by carvers and ivory processors for illegal raw ivory doubled (from \$150 to \$350 per kilogram); and it doubled again between 2005 and 2010 (to \$750 per kilogram).<sup>7</sup> As prices have increased, so has poaching, with an estimated 30,000 elephants killed in 2012.<sup>8</sup>

While the general public seems aware of the huge role Chinese demand for elephant ivory has played in elephant poaching and the illegal ivory trade, many don't realize that the U.S. also contributes significantly to this problem as the world's second largest retail market for ivory.<sup>9</sup> Indeed, the most recent ivory survey of the U.S., conducted in 2008, found 24,004 ivory items for sale in 657 outlets in 16 towns and cities across the U.S.<sup>10</sup>

Hawaii is one of the epicenters of the U.S. market, as the third largest ivory market in the country following New York and California. The 2008 ivory survey found 23 outlets – mainly antique shops and tourist markets (i.e., conglomerations of stalls, kiosks or shops in a large open area or multi-story building) – selling 1,867 ivory items on Oahu.<sup>11</sup> The vast majority of the items for sale were jewelry (80%), followed by netsukes (12%), human figurines (4%), animal figurines (<1%), and chopsticks (<1%).<sup>12</sup> Almost 90% of the ivory items for sale in Hawaii were likely imported illegally or are of unknown origin.<sup>13</sup> In other words, almost 90% or 1,478 ivory items could have been from recently killed elephants. Further, according to the Humane Society of the United States, Hawaii has what is likely the largest online ivory marketplace in the country, with seven major retail outlets on the internet offering, combined, approximately 1,153 ivory objects for sale, all of which could very well be illegal.

---

<sup>6</sup> *Rarity Value*, *supra* note 4.

<sup>7</sup> CITES Secretariat, *Elephant Conservation, Illegal Killing and Ivory Trade*, at 13, SC62 Doc. 46.1 (Rev. 1) (2012), <http://www.cites.org/eng/com/sc/62/E62-46-01.pdf>.

<sup>8</sup> CITES, IUCN & TRAFFIC, *Status of African elephant populations and levels of illegal killing and the illegal trade in ivory: A report to the African Elephant Summit* (2013), [https://cmsdata.iucn.org/downloads/african\\_elephant\\_summit\\_background\\_document\\_2013\\_en.pdf](https://cmsdata.iucn.org/downloads/african_elephant_summit_background_document_2013_en.pdf).

<sup>9</sup> Esmond Martin & Daniel Stiles, *Ivory Markets in the USA*, at 5 (2008), <http://www.savetheelephants.org/files/pdf/publications/2008%20Martin%20&%20Stiles%20Ivory%20Markets%20in%20the%20USA.pdf>; UNEP, TRAFFIC, CITES & IUCN, *Elephants in the Dust: The African Elephant Crisis*, at 65 (2013), [http://www.cites.org/common/resources/pub/Elephants\\_in\\_the\\_dust.pdf](http://www.cites.org/common/resources/pub/Elephants_in_the_dust.pdf).

<sup>10</sup> Martin & Stiles, *supra* note 9, at 5; *see also* Humane Society of the United States, *An Investigation of Ivory Markets in the United States*, at 6 (2002), [http://www.humanesociety.org/assets/pdfs/Ivory\\_Trade\\_Report.pdf](http://www.humanesociety.org/assets/pdfs/Ivory_Trade_Report.pdf).

<sup>11</sup> Martin & Stiles, *supra* note 9, at 93.

<sup>12</sup> *Id.* at 94.

<sup>13</sup> *Id.*

The vast majority of ivory in Hawaii comes from China, where the number of registered ivory factories and ivory retail outlets has risen.<sup>14</sup> The 2008 survey found that of the 1,317 ivory items in Hawaii that could be attributed to place of manufacture, 73% were from China. Ivory is smuggled to the U.S. illegally by individuals and via shipping carriers.<sup>15</sup> Most packages containing ivory are not marked as required by federal laws, but are instead mislabeled as “crafts” or “bone.”<sup>16</sup> Much of the ivory coming to the U.S. is purchased illegally over the Internet, often from sites based in China.<sup>17</sup> Ivory also enters the U.S. by falsely claiming to meet U.S. import exceptions.<sup>18</sup>

Currently, Hawaii’s ivory law allows sales if the ivory was imported before 1989 or is at least 100 years old at the time of import and has not been altered since. HB 493 SD 1 will narrow these exceptions by requiring sellers to meet documentation requirements recently proposed by the federal government. This will make it more difficult for sellers to pretend that their ivory is old when it is actually from recently poached elephants. Further, by covering all types of ivory, HB 493 SD 1 will make it more difficult for sellers to claim that the ivory comes from a legal source of ivory when it is actually from elephants. Lastly, the increased penalties proscribed in HB 493 SD 1 for those who violate Hawaii’s ivory law will act as a deterrent for wildlife traffickers.

While HB 493 SD 1 includes some exceptions not contained in the ivory bills originally introduced in the House and Senate, it would still be a significant step towards ending Hawaii’s involvement in the elephant poaching crises. To be one of the first states in the country with a strong ivory law would be a huge achievement for Hawaii, allowing the state to be seen as a leader on an issue that is currently garnering a great deal of attention both domestically and internationally. For these reasons, and those outlined above, we respectfully encourage you to support HB 493 SD 1. Thank you very much for the opportunity to testify.

---

<sup>14</sup> *Elephants in the Dust*, *supra* note 9, at 63; HSUS, *supra* note 10, at 1.

<sup>15</sup> Esmond Martin, *Are we winning the case for ivory substitutes in China*, *Pachyderm*, 40: 88-100 (2006).

<sup>16</sup> Environmental Investigations Agency, *Made in China* (2007), <http://eia-global.org/news-media/made-in-china-how-chinas-illegal-ivory-trade-is-causing-a-21st-century-afri>.

<sup>17</sup> Doug Williamson, *The Status of the U.S. Trade in Elephant and Hippo Ivory*, at 4, 26 (2004), [http://assets.worldwildlife.org/publications/425/files/original/Tackling\\_the\\_Ivories.pdf?1345757077](http://assets.worldwildlife.org/publications/425/files/original/Tackling_the_Ivories.pdf?1345757077).

<sup>18</sup> Martin & Stiles, *supra* note 9, at 18.



March 26, 2014

Hawaii State Legislature  
Hawaii State Capitol  
415 S. Beretania  
Honolulu, HI 96813



Ivory Trade Restrictions in Hawaii

Dear Honorable Legislators,

We respectfully urge your support for House Bill 493, Senate Draft 1, relating to animal cruelty; ivory sales. Hawaii has the opportunity to be a global leader in wildlife conservation by ending the trade and sale of illegal ivory. It is only by ending the supply and sale of ivory products that the African elephant may survive.

Ivory retail investigations in 2002, 2008 and of on-line ivory sales in 2013, showed that Hawaii is the 3<sup>rd</sup> largest retailer of ivory and ivory products in the nation, only behind New York (where a similar bill is under consideration) and California. Of more than 1,600 ivory items offered for sale in Hawaii, 89 percent were estimated to be of unknown or likely illegal origin. Hawaii arguably had the largest on-line sales market for ivory; a major concern for both residents and visitors who may unknowingly purchase illegal ivory in violation of federal and international laws.

This state legislation also complements a recent order issued by the United States Fish and Wildlife Service, at the urging of the Obama Administration, to enhance enforcement efforts on the import, export and inter-state sale of ivory and other illegal wildlife products, due to the trade's connection to criminal terrorist activity and the destabilization of economic and international security. Ivory items with appropriate documentation noting age, origin and species, may continue to be sold in Hawaii.

We are deeply concerned about the unprecedented elephant poaching crisis and horrified by the imminent possibility that African elephants could be extinct in less than two decades. The illegal ivory trade fuels criminal activities that undermine local governance and the rule of law. The decimation of wild animals also threatens the livelihood of communities who depend on wildlife for economic development. Elephant poaching has been linked to several African armed and militia groups who used the proceeds from ivory sales to fund their nefarious activities. We do not want to see the market demand for ivory in the U.S., and especially in Hawaii, to be part of the illicit chain of blood ivory. We echo the call for a complete ban on ivory sales in the U.S. by former Secretary of State Hillary Clinton and vice-chair of the Clinton Foundation Chelsea Clinton.

Again, we urge your support for House Bill 493, Senate Draft 1. Hawaii has so much to be proud of - contributing to the massacre of elephants by allowing the trade in illegal ivory should not be one of them.

Sincerely,

Jen Samuel

Elephants DC, president



49 South Hotel Street, Room 314 | Honolulu, HI 96813  
[www.lwv-hawaii.com](http://www.lwv-hawaii.com) | 808.531.7448 | [voters@lwv-hawaii.com](mailto:voters@lwv-hawaii.com)

COMMITTEE ON WAYS AND MEANS

Friday, March 28, 2014, 9:25 a.m. Room 211  
HB493, HD1, SD1 RELATING TO ANIMAL CRUELTY

TESTIMONY

Janet Mason, Legislative Chair, League of Women Voters of Hawaii

Chair Name/Names, Vice-Chair Name or Names, and Committee Members:

**The League of Women Voters of Hawaii opposes HB493, HD1, SD1**, Relating to Animal Cruelty, on the basis that the measure was “gutted and replaced” so that the purpose of the SD1 version of the bill is totally different from the original bill. The SD 1 version of the bill never had a public hearing in the House of Representatives, so we don’t know how this bill could become law. It is the clear intent of the Hawaii State Constitution that the public be given reasonable notice and the opportunity to submit testimony in both one committee of the State House and in one committee of the State Senate concerning any proposed statutory amendment.

We urge you to hold this bill. Thank you for the opportunity to submit testimony.



IN DEFENSE OF ANIMALS

March 27, 2014

Hawaii State Legislature  
Hawaii State Capitol  
415 S. Beretania  
Honolulu, HI 96813

Dear Honorable Legislators,

On behalf of In Defense of Animals (IDA), an international animal protection organization, and our members in Hawaii, I respectfully urge your support for House Bill 493, Senate Draft 1, relating to animal cruelty; ivory sales. Hawaii has the opportunity to be a global leader in wildlife conservation by ending the trade and sale of illegal ivory. It is only by ending the supply and sale of ivory products that the African elephant may survive.

Ivory retail investigations in 2002, 2008 and of on-line ivory sales in 2013, showed that Hawaii is the 3<sup>rd</sup> largest retailer of ivory and ivory products in the nation, only behind New York (where a similar bill is under consideration) and California. Of more than 1,600 ivory items offered for sale in Hawaii, 89 percent were estimated to be of unknown or likely illegal origin. Hawaii arguably had the largest on-line sales market for ivory; a major concern for both residents and visitors who may unknowingly purchase illegal ivory in violation of federal and international laws.

This state legislation also complements a recent order issued by the United States Fish and Wildlife Service, at the urging of the Obama Administration, to enhance enforcement efforts on the import, export and inter-state sale of ivory and other illegal wildlife products, due to the trade's connection to criminal terrorist activity and the destabilization of economic and international security. Ivory items with appropriate documentation noting age, origin and species, may continue to be sold in Hawaii.

IDA is deeply concerned about the unprecedented elephant poaching crisis and the imminent possibility that African elephants could be extinct in less than two decades. The illegal ivory trade fuels criminal activities that undermine local governance and the rule of law. The decimation of wild animals also threatens the livelihood of communities who depend on wildlife for economic development. Elephant poaching has been linked to several African armed and militia groups who used the proceeds from ivory sales to fund their nefarious activities. IDA does not want to see the market demand for ivory in the U.S., and especially in Hawaii, to be part of the illicit chain of blood ivory. We echo the call for a complete ban on ivory sales in the U.S. by former Secretary of State Hillary Clinton and vice-chair of the Clinton Foundation Chelsea Clinton.

Again, IDA urges your support for House Bill 493, Senate Draft 1. Hawaii has so much to be proud of; contributing to the massacre of elephants by allowing the trade in illegal ivory should not be one of them.

Sincerely,

Nicole Meyer  
Director, Elephant Protection Campaign  
In Defense of Animals

**In Defense of Animals**  
San Rafael, California  
[info@idausa.org](mailto:info@idausa.org)  
[www.idausa.org](http://www.idausa.org)

**IDA Hope Animal Sanctuary**  
Grenada, Mississippi  
[www.idausa.org/Hope](http://www.idausa.org/Hope)

**IDA Africa**  
Sanaga-Yong Chimpanzee Rescue Center  
Cameroon, Africa  
[www.idausa.org/Africa](http://www.idausa.org/Africa)

**IDA India**  
Mumbai, India  
[www.idausa.org/India](http://www.idausa.org/India)

**Fighting Apathy, Building Empathy**

**From:** [Amanda Michelle Milster](#)  
**To:** [WAM Testimony](#)  
**Subject:** WAM 3-28-14,SUPPORT FOR HB 493 SD1; RELATING TO ANIMAL CRUELTY; IVORY SALES  
**Date:** Thursday, March 27, 2014 7:33:55 AM

---

Dear Lawmakers:

An unprecedented elephant poaching crisis is decimating elephant populations. If this continues, African elephants could be extinct in less than two decades. The ivory trade breeds corruption, undermines the rule of law and threatens the economic livelihood of the local communities. Illegal ivory trade also challenges the regional security in Africa as militia and armed groups have engaged in poaching and used the proceeds from ivory to fund nefarious activities.

[Hawaii](#) is the third largest market for ivory in the U.S. Surveys found that close to 90% of ivory items for sale in Hawaii could be of illegal or unknown origins. As a visitor to Hawaii, I am confident that such a beautiful and welcoming state will do the morally correct thing take decisive action to end cruelty. Please support HB 493 SD 1 to save the elephants and end the Aloha State's contribution to the illegal and blood ivory trade. Thank you for your consideration.

Amanda Milster  
Washington, D.C.

**From:** [ashley prout](#)  
**To:** [WAM Testimony](#)  
**Subject:** Please, please, please....  
**Date:** Wednesday, March 26, 2014 5:04:54 AM

---

BAN the ivory trade. It will be one of your state's PROUDEST moments and you will have huge credit for being the first. I am behind Vermont being right behind you-- all 50 states will follow. Hawaii will have huge fame for being FIRST. BAN IVORY TRADE!

THANK YOU!

Ashley

Ashley Prout McAvey  
144 Shelburne-Hinesburg Road  
Shelburne, VT 05482  
Home Office: 802-264-9640  
Cell Phone: 802-598-9428

**From:** [villalobos.carrissa@gmail.com](mailto:villalobos.carrissa@gmail.com)  
**To:** [WAM Testimony](#)  
**Subject:** Support for HB 493 SD 1  
**Date:** Thursday, March 27, 2014 8:01:07 AM

---

Please support this bill and help stop the ivory trade. In our modern times it is despicable to think that we as a society would allow the beautiful elephant population to be decimated.

Please support this Bill!

Carrissa M. Villalobos  
Chatsworth, CA

**From:** [Daniel Tham](#)  
**To:** [WAM Testimony](#)  
**Subject:** Fwd: PLEASE SUPPORT HB 493 SD1!  
**Date:** Tuesday, March 25, 2014 5:27:44 PM

---

----- Forwarded message -----

**From:** **Daniel Tham** <[danwt88@gmail.com](mailto:danwt88@gmail.com)>  
**Date:** Wed, Mar 26, 2014 at 11:25 AM  
**Subject:** Re: PLEASE SUPPORT HB 493 SD1!  
**To:** [JDLTestimony@capitol.hawaii.gov](mailto:JDLTestimony@capitol.hawaii.gov), [reps@capitol.hawaii.gov](mailto:reps@capitol.hawaii.gov),  
[reprhoads@capitol.hawaii.gov](mailto:reprhoads@capitol.hawaii.gov), [judgetestimony@capitol.hawaii.gov](mailto:judgetestimony@capitol.hawaii.gov),  
[EDBtestimony@capitol.hawaii.gov](mailto:EDBtestimony@capitol.hawaii.gov), [reptsuji@capitol.hawaii.gov](mailto:reptsuji@capitol.hawaii.gov),  
[repward@capitol.hawaii.gov](mailto:repward@capitol.hawaii.gov)

Dear Sirs,

Greetings! I hope this finds you well.

PLEASE SUPPORT HB2183! Ivory is (primarily) the outcome of poaching. The unmitigated and relentless poaching of African elephants. It is well established that poaching (also) sponsors terrorism. I am urging your committee to encourage enforcing an end to the trade and importation of ivory (whether raw or vanity) in and to the state of Hawaii.

It is with great pride and much aloha that I support this effort by the HSUS to end the ivory trade in the Aloha State, unfortunately a "top" ivory market in the USA, possibly next only to New York and perhaps ahead of San Francisco.

I write on behalf of all victims, human and animal alike, of the horrific poaching crisis in Africa. Poaching sponsors terrorism, kills 35,000+ elephants each year, 100 a day and an astounding 1 every fifteen minutes; The elephant, a keystone species and Earth's grandest terrestrial herbivore is slated for extinction in the wilds of Africa within 10 years. Amongst the human victims of poaching are the 1000+ rangers who were murdered in the line of duty in the past 10 years alone.

It is also well established that the killing of critically endangered wild animals and the sale of their body parts is funding terrorism - which includes the recent Westgate mall attack and the killing of innocent human victims in Nairobi, Kenya.

A compassionate, progressive and dynamic state, a state of by and for the people, I am confident the Aloha state will do the right thing by Earth's last elephants, the people of the continent of Africa, the people of the world and the people of Hawaii.

As global citizens, as the gateway to the east, the Aloha state and the USA must take on a strong and unequivocal leadership role to end the ivory trade immediately.

I thank you for your time and efforts and thank the HSUS for its initiative on this most critical issue.

Be well and Mahalo nui loa.

Warmly,  
Daniel Tham  
Singapore

On Wed, Mar 26, 2014 at 11:25 AM, Daniel Tham <[danwt88@gmail.com](mailto:danwt88@gmail.com)> wrote:

Dear Honorable Representatives,

Thank you for your compassion and leadership. Hawaii is poised to be a global leader in elephant conservation. Please support HB2183 to stop the ongoing massacre of elephants by ending the sale of ivory in Hawaii. \*line or two personalized\*

Sincerely,

**Daniel Tham**



**From:** [Debbie McFee](#)  
**To:** [WAM Testimony](#)  
**Subject:** WAM 3-28-14, SUPPORT FOR HB 493 SD1  
**Date:** Thursday, March 27, 2014 8:40:39 AM

---

Dear Lawmakers:

An unprecedented elephant poaching crisis is decimating elephant populations. Tragically, African elephants could be extinct in less than two decades because of market appetite for ivory trinkets, such as earrings, bracelets, necklaces, statuettes. The cruel ivory trade breeds corruption, undermines the rule of law, and threatens the economic livelihood of the local communities. The illegal ivory trade also challenges the regional security in Africa as militia and armed groups have engaged in poaching and used the proceeds from ivory to fund nefarious activities.

Hawaii is the third largest market for ivory in the U.S. Surveys found that close to 90% of ivory items for sale in Hawaii could be from illegal or unknown origins. Please support HB 493 SD 1 to save the elephants and end the Aloha State's contribution to the illegal and blood ivory trade.

Our elephant friends need our help!  
Thank you for your consideration.

Debra McFee

Hampton, VA

=====

**From:** [Ginny Tiu](#)  
**To:** [WAM Testimony](#)  
**Subject:** HB 493  
**Date:** Thursday, March 27, 2014 1:17:19 AM

---

Dear Chair Ige and Committee Members,

I humbly ask you to please support HB 493, prohibiting the sale of ivory. The current bill has addressed many of the concerns of those opposing the bill.

Ivory is acquired in a very cruel and inhumane way. Elephants are trapped in horrifically torturous devices, and then have their faces chopped off while they are still alive, because the poachers have to acquire their tusks in a swift manner, since it is illegal. And all for what? So that one can have trinkets and jewelry made of ivory, or have an ivory carving to adorn one's home? This is too cruel and decadent. At the current rate that elephants are being slaughtered for their tusks, they will soon be extinct. We cannot encourage a society to be so self serving that they demand the right to do what they want, with no consideration of the consequences to these wonderful creatures and to our future generations.

Thank you so much for your consideration.

Aloha,  
Ginny Tiu

Sent from my iPhone

**From:** [Heidi Osterman](#)  
**To:** [WAM Testimony](#)  
**Subject:** WAM 3-28-14,SUPPORT FOR HB 493 SD1; RELATING TO ANIMAL CRUELTY; IVORY SALES"  
**Date:** Wednesday, March 26, 2014 4:21:57 PM

---

Dear Chair Ige,

An unprecedented elephant poaching crisis is decimating elephant populations. African elephants could be extinct in less than two decades. All because of market appetite for ivory trinkets, such as earrings, bracelets, necklaces, statuettes. Cruel ivory trade breeds corruption, undermines the rule of law and threatens the economic livelihood of the local communities. Illegal ivory trade also challenges the regional security in Africa as militia and armed groups have engaged in poaching and used the proceeds from ivory to fund nefarious activities.

Hawaii is the third largest market for ivory in the U.S. Surveys found that close to 90% of ivory items for sale in Hawaii could be of illegal or unknown origins. Please support HB 493 SD 1 to save the elephants and end the Aloha State's contribution to the illegal and blood ivory trade. Thank you for your consideration.

Sincerely,

Heidi Osterman  
Clarksville, Maryland

**From:** [Keith Croes](#)  
**To:** [WAM Testimony](#)  
**Subject:** Please support HB 493 SD 1 to end ivory trade in Hawaii  
**Date:** Wednesday, March 26, 2014 6:50:33 AM

---

Dear Chair Ige:

An unprecedented elephant poaching crisis is decimating elephant populations. African elephants could be extinct in less than two decades. All because of market appetite for ivory trinkets, such as earrings, bracelets, necklaces, statuettes. Cruel ivory trade breeds corruption, undermines the rule of law and threatens the economic livelihood of the local communities. Illegal ivory trade also challenges the regional security in Africa as militia and armed groups have engaged in poaching and used the proceeds from ivory to fund nefarious activities.

Hawaii is the third largest market for ivory in the U.S. Surveys found that close to 90% of ivory items for sale in Hawaii could be of illegal or unknown origins. Please support HB 493 SD 1 to save the elephants and end the Aloha State's contribution to the illegal and blood ivory trade. Thank you for your consideration.

Keith Croes

Williamsburg, VA



**Keith Croes**

| m: 973-970-3505

| e: [kjcroes@gmail.com](mailto:kjcroes@gmail.com)



Contact me:  keith.croes

**From:** [stlilac@aol.com](mailto:stlilac@aol.com)  
**To:** [WAM Testimony](#)  
**Subject:** Ivory trade  
**Date:** Wednesday, March 26, 2014 3:25:12 PM

---

Dear Chair Ige,

My name is Michelle Uglow and I live in Las Vegas, NV. I love elephants so much, I can not begin to tell you. Please stop ivory trade. If we don't make a huge change immediately, they will not be around in ten years. Please do something now, I'm pleading with you.

Thank you,

Best Regards,

Michelle Uglow

**From:** [nicolelauren33](#)  
**To:** [WAM Testimony](#)  
**Subject:** Elephants need your Respect and Leadership NOW  
**Date:** Wednesday, March 26, 2014 5:50:32 AM

---

Dear Chair Ige:

An unprecedented elephant poaching crisis is decimating elephant populations. African elephants could be extinct in less than two decades. All because of market appetite for ivory trinkets, such as earrings, bracelets, necklaces, statuettes. Cruel ivory trade breeds corruption, undermines the rule of law and threatens the economic livelihood of the local communities. Illegal ivory trade also challenges the regional security in Africa as militia and armed groups have engaged in poaching and used the proceeds from ivory to fund nefarious activities.

Hawaii is the third largest market for ivory in the U.S. Surveys found that close to 90% of ivory items for sale in Hawaii could be of illegal or unknown origins. Please support HB 493 SD 1 to save the elephants and end the Aloha State's contribution to the illegal and blood ivory trade. Thank you for your consideration.

With Peace and Compassion for ALL LIFE,  
Nicole Schrank, MSW  
Florida, USA

**From:** [humbalapa.](#)  
**To:** [WAM Testimony](#)  
**Subject:** Elephant poaching - worldwide crisis situation for all elephants  
**Date:** Thursday, March 27, 2014 8:46:13 AM

---

Dear Lawmakers:

As a US citizen of African heritage, I am writing to you today with the utmost respect to BEG for your cooperation in passing HB 493 SD1. This is an action which MUST NOT be delayed or argued any further!

An unprecedented elephant poaching crisis is decimating elephant populations around the world. If nothing is done, African elephants could be extinct in less than two decades. All because of market appetite for ivory trinkets, such as earrings, bracelets, necklaces, statuettes. Cruel ivory trade breeds corruption, undermines the rule of law and threatens the economic livelihood of the local communities. Illegal ivory trade also challenges the regional security in Africa as militia and armed groups have engaged in poaching and used the proceeds from ivory to fund nefarious activities.

Hawaii is the third largest market for ivory in the U.S. Surveys found that close to 90% of ivory items for sale in Hawaii could be of illegal or unknown origins. Please support HB 493 SD 1 to save the elephants and end the Aloha State's contribution to the illegal and blood ivory trade.

Thank you for your consideration.

Mrs. Pamela Freeman

California

**From:** [mailinglist@capitol.hawaii.gov](mailto:mailinglist@capitol.hawaii.gov)  
**To:** [WAM Testimony](#)  
**Cc:** [octopus@maui.net](mailto:octopus@maui.net)  
**Subject:** Submitted testimony for HB493 on Mar 28, 2014 09:25AM  
**Date:** Tuesday, March 25, 2014 2:16:25 PM

---

**HB493**

Submitted on: 3/25/2014

Testimony for WAM on Mar 28, 2014 09:25AM in Conference Room 211

<b>Submitted By</b>	<b>Organization</b>	<b>Testifier Position</b>	<b>Present at Hearing</b>
Rene Umberger	Individual	Support	No

Comments: Aloha Chair Ige and Committee members, Please pass this bill ending ivory sales in Hawaii.

Please note that testimony submitted less than 24 hours prior to the hearing, improperly identified, or directed to the incorrect office, may not be posted online or distributed to the committee prior to the convening of the public hearing.

Do not reply to this email. This inbox is not monitored. For assistance please email [webmaster@capitol.hawaii.gov](mailto:webmaster@capitol.hawaii.gov)



**From:** [Robert Bounds](#)  
**To:** [WAM Testimony](#)  
**Subject:** PLEASE Support HB493 SD1 to Protect Elephants  
**Date:** Thursday, March 27, 2014 11:16:04 AM

---

please support HB493 SD1 to protect elephants from the cruel, unnecessary and illegal ivory trade in Hawaii!

Thank you,

Robert Bounds, Big Island , HI 96778

**From:** [Stacy Davis](#)  
**To:** [WAM Testimony](#)  
**Subject:** WAM 3-28-14, SUPPORT FOR HB 493 SD1  
**Date:** Thursday, March 27, 2014 8:43:57 AM

---

Dear Lawmakers:

An unprecedented elephant poaching crisis is decimating elephant populations. African elephants could be extinct in less than two decades. All because of market appetite for ivory trinkets, such as earrings, bracelets, necklaces, statuettes. Cruel ivory trade breeds corruption, undermines the rule of law and threatens the economic livelihood of the local communities. Illegal ivory trade also challenges the regional security in Africa as militia and armed groups have engaged in poaching and used the proceeds from ivory to fund nefarious activities.

Hawaii is the third largest market for ivory in the U.S. Surveys found that close to 90% of ivory items for sale in Hawaii could be of illegal or unknown origins. Please support HB 493 SD 1 to save the elephants and end the Aloha State's contribution to the illegal and blood ivory trade.

Thank you for your consideration.  
Stacy Davis  
Falls Church VA 22044

**From:** [Tina Bounds](#)  
**To:** [WAM Testimony](#)  
**Subject:** PLEEEAAAASE Support HB493 SD1  
**Date:** Thursday, March 27, 2014 12:54:34 AM

---

Elephants are God's creatures too, just like you and me. God did not put these magnificent Animals, these beautiful beings on this earth for human vanity.

Please do the right thing.....protect the Elephriends from the barbaric & illegal ivory trade in Hawaii.

Tusk/Ivory belongs on the Elephants NOT humans!!!

Merci beaucoup,

Tina