



Office of the Public Defender State of Hawaii

Timothy Ho, Chief Deputy Public Defender
Testimony of the Office of the Public Defender,
State of Hawaii to the House Committee on Judiciary



February 21, 2012, 2:00 p.m.

RE: H.B. 1170: Relating To Offenses Against Public Order

Chair Keith-Agaran and Members of the Committee:

This measure would make the consumption of or trafficking in cat, dog or equine animal meat a misdemeanor offense punishable by up to one year in jail and/or a two thousand dollar fine.

The Office of the Public Defender opposes H.B. 1170.

This measure amounts to racial and cultural discrimination. The human consumption of cats, dogs or horses, while seemingly disgusting to the general public who are used to seeing these animals as house pets, are culturally acceptable to minority of our population. The consumption of beef by Hindus and pork by Jews are prohibited by their religion. They may have the same reaction to our consumption of beef or pork that some of us have about eating cats or dogs. Yet we would never think of passing legislation to prohibit the human consumption of pork or beef, because it's consumption is accepted by the majority of our population. How far would a bill banning the human consumption of pork or beef go? Would such a bill even be given a hearing?

I myself have had a chance to eat rabbit, deer, frogs, buffalo, dried lizards and sea turtle (before it became illegal), all very tasty food. I would never consider eating a cat, dog or a horse. Does this mean no one else should eat cats or dogs or horses?

Yes, we see cats and dogs as pets. The killing of a "pet" animal belonging to another person is already prohibited and constitutes the offense of Cruelty to Animals in the First Degree, a class C felony. Torturing, mutilating or poisoning any pet animal or equine animal, is also a class C felony. The penalties for the same conduct proscribed in this measure are far more serious than that which is proposed in this bill.

We oppose H.B. 1170. Thank you for the opportunity to comment on this bill.



THE HUMANE SOCIETY
OF THE UNITED STATES

TO: Honorable Chair Keith-Agaran, Vice-Chair Rhoades and Committee Members

House Judiciary Committee, 2-21-12, 200pm, Room 325

RE: Testimony in SUPPORT of HB1170; Animal Cruelty- Pet Consumption

Submitted by: Inga Gibson, Hawaii State Director, The Humane Society of the United States,
P.O. Box 89131, Honolulu, HI 96830, igibson@hsus.org, 808-922-9910

On behalf of our more than 50,000 members and supporters in Hawaii, we thank the Committee for considering HB 1170; to explicitly prohibit the consumption, trade, sale or trafficking in dog, cat or equine animal carcasses.

We all remember the case involving “Caddy”, a pet dog who was stolen from the Moanalua Golf Course in 2007 and subsequently killed for consumption. While the defendants were the first to be charged under our felony animal cruelty law, and also charged for theft, their admission to this crime, coupled with determination of the method of death meeting the definition of torture, is what ultimately led to their prosecution.

Current law does not explicitly prohibit the consumption or killing for consumption of dogs, cats and horses, who are considered family companion pets, not a food source. This law would send a strong message to the community that the cruel killing of pets for consumption will not be tolerated. Furthermore, this would provide local law enforcement and animal control with another tool to investigate and charge those who may be killing and or selling pet animals for food, but are unable to determine the exact method of killing (post-mortem).

This measure would not prohibit the continued lawful slaughter or consumption of other non-companion animals and again, is specifically focused on those species considered pets.

We respectfully urge your support of HB 1170.

Testimony for HB1170 on 2/21/2012 2:00:00 PM

mailinglist@capitol.hawaii.gov [mailinglist@capitol.hawaii.gov]

Sent: Monday, February 20, 2012 7:58 PM

To: JUDtestimony

Cc: towle@hawaiiantel.net

Testimony for JUD 2/21/2012 2:00:00 PM HB1170

Conference room: 325

Testifier position: Support

Testifier will be present: No

Submitted by: Ginger Towle, President

Organization: West Hawaii Humane Society

E-mail: towle@hawaiiantel.net

Submitted on: 2/20/2012

Comments:

Dogs, cats and horses are our pets, not dinner! Animals have been stolen from, golf courses, shelters and from neighbors kennels. This practice is not acceptable in a civilized society. It certainly doesn't show an Aloha spirit. It's time that we protected those who cannot protect themselves.

PLEASE pass this law. Thank you for the opportunity to testify.

Testimony for HB1170 on 2/21/2012 2:00:00 PM

mailinglist@capitol.hawaii.gov [mailinglist@capitol.hawaii.gov]

Sent: Monday, February 20, 2012 11:23 AM

To: JUDtestimony

Cc: kale@k9kokua.org

Testimony for JUD 2/21/2012 2:00:00 PM HB1170

Conference room: 325

Testifier position: Support

Testifier will be present: Yes

Submitted by: kale

Organization: K9 Kokua

E-mail: kale@k9kokua.org

Submitted on: 2/20/2012

Comments:

Testimony for HB1170 on 2/21/2012 2:00:00 PM

mailinglist@capitol.hawaii.gov [mailinglist@capitol.hawaii.gov]

Sent: Sunday, February 19, 2012 7:52 PM

To: JUDtestimony

Cc: director@equine808.com

Testimony for JUD 2/21/2012 2:00:00 PM HB1170

Conference room: 325

Testifier position: Support

Testifier will be present: No

Submitted by: Betina Parker

Organization: Equine 808 Horse Rescue

E-mail: director@equine808.com

Submitted on: 2/19/2012

Comments:

Testimony for HB1170 on 2/21/2012 2:00:00 PM

mailinglist@capitol.hawaii.gov [mailinglist@capitol.hawaii.gov]

Sent: Monday, February 20, 2012 10:07 PM

To: JUDtestimony

Cc: Ktntt@hawaii.rr.com

Testimony for JUD 2/21/2012 2:00:00 PM HB1170

Conference room: 325

Testifier position: Support

Testifier will be present: No

Submitted by: Stacey Shimomura

Organization: Individual

E-mail: Ktntt@hawaii.rr.com

Submitted on: 2/20/2012

Comments:

Testimony for HB1170 on 2/21/2012 2:00:00 PM

mailinglist@capitol.hawaii.gov [mailinglist@capitol.hawaii.gov]

Sent: Tuesday, February 21, 2012 7:39 AM

To: JUDtestimony

Cc: Castillo_trina@hotmail.com

Testimony for JUD 2/21/2012 2:00:00 PM HB1170

Conference room: 325

Testifier position: Support

Testifier will be present: No

Submitted by: Trina Castillo

Organization: Individual

E-mail: Castillo_trina@hotmail.com

Submitted on: 2/21/2012

Comments:

Testimony for HB1170 on 2/21/2012 2:00:00 PM

mailinglist@capitol.hawaii.gov [mailinglist@capitol.hawaii.gov]

Sent: Sunday, February 19, 2012 6:31 PM

To: JUDtestimony

Cc: Shelbshotmail22@gmail.com

Testimony for JUD 2/21/2012 2:00:00 PM HB1170

Conference room: 325

Testifier position: Support

Testifier will be present: No

Submitted by: Shelbie Pang

Organization: Individual

E-mail: Shelbshotmail22@gmail.com

Submitted on: 2/19/2012

Comments:

Testimony for HB1170 on 2/21/2012 2:00:00 PM

mailinglist@capitol.hawaii.gov [mailinglist@capitol.hawaii.gov]

Sent: Monday, February 20, 2012 7:42 AM

To: JUDtestimony

Cc: octopus@maui.net

Testimony for JUD 2/21/2012 2:00:00 PM HB1170

Conference room: 325

Testifier position: Support

Testifier will be present: No

Submitted by: Rene Umberger

Organization: Individual

E-mail: octopus@maui.net

Submitted on: 2/20/2012

Comments:

Testimony for HB1170 on 2/21/2012 2:00:00 PM

mailinglist@capitol.hawaii.gov [mailinglist@capitol.hawaii.gov]

Sent: Monday, February 20, 2012 2:56 PM

To: JUDtestimony

Cc: spikecat1@aol.com

Testimony for JUD 2/21/2012 2:00:00 PM HB1170

Conference room: 325

Testifier position: Support

Testifier will be present: No

Submitted by: Judith Aikawa

Organization: Individual

E-mail: spikecat1@aol.com

Submitted on: 2/20/2012

Comments:

Testimony for HB1170 on 2/21/2012 2:00:00 PM

mailinglist@capitol.hawaii.gov [mailinglist@capitol.hawaii.gov]

Sent: Monday, February 20, 2012 4:41 PM

To: JUDtestimony

Cc: feathers03@me.com

Testimony for JUD 2/21/2012 2:00:00 PM HB1170

Conference room: 325

Testifier position:

Testifier will be present: No

Submitted by: Margaret Sueoka

Organization: Individual

E-mail: feathers03@me.com

Submitted on: 2/20/2012

Comments:

Testimony for HB1170 on 2/21/2012 2:00:00 PM

mailinglist@capitol.hawaii.gov [mailinglist@capitol.hawaii.gov]

Sent: Monday, February 20, 2012 5:14 PM

To: JUDtestimony

Cc: orrie@hawaiiantel.net

Testimony for JUD 2/21/2012 2:00:00 PM HB1170

Conference room: 325

Testifier position: Support

Testifier will be present: No

Submitted by: Orianna Skomoroch

Organization: Individual

E-mail: orrie@hawaiiantel.net

Submitted on: 2/20/2012

Comments:

Testimony for HB1170 on 2/21/2012 2:00:00 PM

mailinglist@capitol.hawaii.gov [mailinglist@capitol.hawaii.gov]

Sent: Monday, February 20, 2012 5:20 PM

To: JUDtestimony

Cc: ferndoggies@gmail.com

Testimony for JUD 2/21/2012 2:00:00 PM HB1170

Conference room: 325

Testifier position: Support

Testifier will be present: No

Submitted by: P Fern

Organization: Individual

E-mail: ferndoggies@gmail.com

Submitted on: 2/20/2012

Comments:

In remembrance of Caddy the boxer puppy stolen and killed for meat. He made the news because he was stolen by 2 Filipino golf course workers while the dog was in the club house.

My friend's dog was clubbed to death by her neighbor and killed for meat, police told her sorry there is nothing we can do talk to your legislator.

Another friend on the north shore had her entire litter of shar pei pups stolen and killed for meat by some migrant farm workers, again the police says it is ok because there is no law that ban killing dogs for meat.

Please do something, every year this bill gets shelved.

What is the reason for continuing this barbaric killing of dogs for meat ?

Testimony for HB1170 on 2/21/2012 2:00:00 PM

mailinglist@capitol.hawaii.gov [mailinglist@capitol.hawaii.gov]

Sent: Monday, February 20, 2012 12:20 PM

To: JUDtestimony

Cc: FUJII3Comm@yahoo.com

Testimony for JUD 2/21/2012 2:00:00 PM HB1170

Conference room: 325
Testifier position: Support
Testifier will be present: No
Submitted by: Dennis Y. Fujii
Organization: Individual
E-mail: FUJII3Comm@yahoo.com
Submitted on: 2/20/2012

Comments:

I fully support HB1170

Testimony for HB1170 on 2/21/2012 2:00:00 PM

mailinglist@capitol.hawaii.gov [mailinglist@capitol.hawaii.gov]

Sent: Monday, February 20, 2012 2:44 PM

To: JUDtestimony

Cc: rosemarykarlsson@gmail.com

Testimony for JUD 2/21/2012 2:00:00 PM HB1170

Conference room: 325

Testifier position: Support

Testifier will be present: No

Submitted by: Rosemary Karlsson

Organization: Individual

E-mail: rosemarykarlsson@gmail.com

Submitted on: 2/20/2012

Comments:

Dogs are pets in this part of the world, not food.

Testimony for HB1170 on 2/21/2012 2:00:00 PM

mailinglist@capitol.hawaii.gov [mailinglist@capitol.hawaii.gov]

Sent: Monday, February 20, 2012 5:46 PM

To: JUDtestimony

Cc: g2@hokua.org

Testimony for JUD 2/21/2012 2:00:00 PM HB1170

Conference room: 325

Testifier position: Support

Testifier will be present: Yes

Submitted by: Ginny Tiu

Organization: Individual

E-mail: g2@hokua.org

Submitted on: 2/20/2012

Comments:

Please support this bill. I can't imagine the suffering of these poor animals.

Thank you so much for your consideration.

Ginny Tiu

Testimony for HB1170 on 2/21/2012 2:00:00 PM

mailinglist@capitol.hawaii.gov [mailinglist@capitol.hawaii.gov]

Sent: Monday, February 20, 2012 10:48 PM

To: JUDtestimony

Cc: stacykt@hawaii.edu

Testimony for JUD 2/21/2012 2:00:00 PM HB1170

Conference room: 325

Testifier position: Support

Testifier will be present: No

Submitted by: Stacy Takekawa

Organization: Individual

E-mail: stacykt@hawaii.edu

Submitted on: 2/20/2012

Comments:

Testimony for HB1170 on 2/21/2012 2:00:00 PM

mailinglist@capitol.hawaii.gov [mailinglist@capitol.hawaii.gov]

Sent: Monday, February 20, 2012 10:16 PM

To: JUDtestimony

Cc: dabosladi@msn.com

Testimony for JUD 2/21/2012 2:00:00 PM HB1170

Conference room: 325

Testifier position: Support

Testifier will be present: No

Submitted by: Barbara J. Matsuo

Organization: Individual

E-mail: dabosladi@msn.com

Submitted on: 2/20/2012

Comments:

Testimony for HB1170 on 2/21/2012 2:00:00 PM

mailinglist@capitol.hawaii.gov [mailinglist@capitol.hawaii.gov]

Sent: Monday, February 20, 2012 6:10 PM

To: JUDtestimony

Cc: dancepups2@yahoo.com

Testimony for JUD 2/21/2012 2:00:00 PM HB1170

Conference room: 325

Testifier position: Support

Testifier will be present: No

Submitted by: Brandi

Organization: Individual

E-mail: dancepups2@yahoo.com

Submitted on: 2/20/2012

Comments:

Testimony for HB1170 on 2/21/2012 2:00:00 PM

mailinglist@capitol.hawaii.gov [mailinglist@capitol.hawaii.gov]

Sent: Monday, February 20, 2012 10:51 PM

To: JUDtestimony

Cc: dbonn1@aol.com

Testimony for JUD 2/21/2012 2:00:00 PM HB1170

Conference room: 325

Testifier position: Support

Testifier will be present: No

Submitted by: Bonnie Lau

Organization: Individual

E-mail: dbonn1@aol.com

Submitted on: 2/20/2012

Comments:

There is ample consumable meat available that can be purchased inexpensively with a good portion of it being wasted. Our society does not need to be obtaining additional protein from these sources.

Testimony for HB1170 on 2/21/2012 2:00:00 PM

Testimony for HB1170 on 2/21/2012 2:00:00 PM

mailinglist@capitol.hawaii.gov [mailinglist@capitol.hawaii.gov]

Sent: Tuesday, February 21, 2012 8:12 AM .

To: JUDtestimony

Cc: darceykatherine@gmail.com

Testimony for JUD 2/21/2012 2:00:00 PM HB1170

Conference room: 325

Testifier position: Support

Testifier will be present: No

Submitted by: katherine uyeno

Organization: Individual

E-mail: darceykatherine@gmail.com

Submitted on: 2/21/2012

Comments:

Testimony for HB1170 on 2/21/2012 2:00:00 PM

mailinglist@capitol.hawaii.gov [mailinglist@capitol.hawaii.gov]

Sent: Monday, February 20, 2012 4:04 PM

To: JUDtestimony

Cc: theresa_pickard@yahoo.com

Testimony for JUD 2/21/2012 2:00:00 PM HB1170

Conference room: 325

Testifier position: Support

Testifier will be present: No

Submitted by: Theresa Donnelly

Organization: Individual

E-mail: theresa_pickard@yahoo.com

Submitted on: 2/20/2012

Comments:

Please support this bill. I am very surprised we don't already have a bill like this. As a civilized society, we must set certain standards that these practices are unacceptable. It makes me very sad that someone could go unpunished without this needed legislation.



Testimony for HB1170 on 2/21/2012 2:00:00 PM

mailinglist@capitol.hawaii.gov [mailinglist@capitol.hawaii.gov]

Sent: Sunday, February 19, 2012 6:32 PM

To: JUDtestimony

Cc: lizrizzo@hawaii.rr.com

Testimony for JUD 2/21/2012 2:00:00 PM HB1170

Conference room: 325

Testifier position: Support

Testifier will be present: No

Submitted by: Elizabeth Rizzo

Organization: Individual

E-mail: lizrizzo@hawaii.rr.com

Submitted on: 2/19/2012

Comments:

Now it doesn't take a rocket scientist to figure out that in our culture it is wrong to eat a cat or a dog. Some people are just messed up and we have to pass laws so the idiots can be stopped from barbaric behaviors. Support the law and thanks for your time.

Testimony for HB1170 on 2/21/2012 2:00:00 PM

mailinglist@capitol.hawaii.gov [mailinglist@capitol.hawaii.gov]

Sent: Sunday, February 19, 2012 4:28 PM

To: JUDtestimony

Cc: sue@kauaibeach.com

Testimony for JUD 2/21/2012 2:00:00 PM HB1170

Conference room: 325
Testifier position: Support
Testifier will be present: No
Submitted by: Sue Scott
Organization: Individual
E-mail: sue@kauaibeach.com
Submitted on: 2/19/2012

Comments:

Please support this bill and protect our companion animals from those who might consider them equal to livestock.

In other countries this practice may be seen in a different perspective but our US culture has a more compassionate and empathetic view of consuming pets for food. It is completely alien to our values and those who move to our country must honor our norms and community values.



Testimony for HB1170 on 2/21/2012 2:00:00 PM

mailinglist@capitol.hawaii.gov [mailinglist@capitol.hawaii.gov]

Sent: Monday, February 20, 2012 4:10 PM

To: JUDtestimony

Cc: g2@hokua.org

Testimony for JUD 2/21/2012 2:00:00 PM HB1170

Conference room: 325
Testifier position: Support
Testifier will be present: Yes
Submitted by: Ginny Tiu
Organization: Individual
E-mail: g2@hokua.org
Submitted on: 2/20/2012

Comments:

I ask the Chair and members of the committee, to please consider that these animals are not "just animals" as some would propose, but that they are living creatures, who feel pain the way that we do, and therefore deserve to be treated humanely.

Thank you very much.



Testimony for HB1170 on 2/21/2012 2:00:00 PM

mailinglist@capitol.hawaii.gov [mailinglist@capitol.hawaii.gov]

Sent: Tuesday, February 21, 2012 7:58 AM

To: JUDtestimony

Cc: donmehling@yahoo.com

Testimony for JUD 2/21/2012 2:00:00 PM HB1170

Conference room: 325
Testifier position: Support
Testifier will be present: No
Submitted by: Donald Mehling
Organization: Individual
E-mail: donmehling@yahoo.com
Submitted on: 2/21/2012

Comments:
Please support this important bill. Pets are not food.

**Testimony for HB1170 on 2/21/2012 2:00:00 PM**

mailinglist@capitol.hawaii.gov [mailinglist@capitol.hawaii.gov]

Sent: Tuesday, February 21, 2012 8:24 AM**To:** JUDtestimony**Cc:** inspirevision@aol.com

Testimony for JUD 2/21/2012 2:00:00 PM HB1170

Conference room: 325
Testifier position: Support
Testifier will be present: No
Submitted by: Jane Shiraki
Organization: Individual
E-mail: inspirevision@aol.com
Submitted on: 2/21/2012

Comments:

Dear Legislature:

Please pass HB 1170!! It would reflect the values of our society. Eating pets is very sick and pets should not be victims of human ignorance. Having had pets, we know that pets, are precious, intelligent, feeling beings, who do not want to be abused, suffer, exactly the same as we humans! They love and want to be loved! People should have access to a wide variety and supply of food products, have knowledge of protein combinations which are non-meat, access to nutrition education, greater invention of non meat recipes, to enhance food variety. Food variety leads to food security, not reliance on habitual one way forms of eating with meat as the only protein source. Please criminalize eating pet animals and pass HB1170!