

---

---

# A BILL FOR AN ACT

RELATING TO INSURANCE.

**BE IT ENACTED BY THE LEGISLATURE OF THE STATE OF HAWAII:**

1           SECTION 1. The insurance commissioner has recently chosen  
2 to interpret Hawaii law as prohibiting the combination of  
3 different types of accident and health or sickness insurance  
4 benefits within the same policy, as a violation of anti-tying  
5 statutes described in section 431:13-103(a)(4)(B), Hawaii  
6 Revised Statutes. The legislature, recognizing that access to  
7 affordable health insurance is one of the state's most pressing  
8 concerns, finds that small accident and health or sickness  
9 insurers lack coercive power and that a prohibition on tying  
10 arrangements by small insurers harms consumers by preventing  
11 small insurers from offering different types of benefits in a  
12 single unified policy. Accordingly, this Act provides the  
13 insurance division in the department of commerce and consumer  
14 affairs with the authority and duty to allow broader  
15 combinations of health insurance benefits in Hawaii.

16           The legislature finds that comparable federal antitrust  
17 laws regarding anti-tying only apply to companies that occupy 30  
18 per cent or more of the market. In the seminal decision of



1 *Jefferson Parish Hospital v. Hyde*, 466 U.S. 2 (1984), the United  
2 States Supreme Court held that under the Sherman Act, Jefferson  
3 Hospital had no market power with an assumed market share of 30  
4 per cent, and therefore its tying arrangement was not unlawful.  
5 See *Hovenkamp*, Federal Antitrust Policy (3d edition, 2005) 402;  
6 *Hack v. President and Fellows of Yale College*, 237 F.3d 81 (2d  
7 Cir. 2000); *Marts v. Xerox*, 77 F.3d 1109, 1113 n.6 (8th Cir.  
8 1996) (18 per cent too small); *Shafi v. St. Francis Hosp.*, 937  
9 F.2d 603 (4th Cir. 1991) (11 per cent insufficient); and  
10 *Grappone, Inc., v. Subarus of New England, Inc.*, 858 F.2d 792,  
11 797 (1st Cir. 1988) (recognizing a general rule of at least 30  
12 per cent). Hence, federal antitrust law reflects the  
13 overarching policy and recognition that small insurers are  
14 essential in providing consumers with coverage options and that  
15 they operate under more significant market constraints than  
16 larger insurers.

17 The purpose of this Act is to bring Hawaii into compliance  
18 with the foregoing well-settled federal standards and thereby  
19 encourage the long-standing practice by smaller accident and  
20 health or sickness insurers to "bundle" different classes of  
21 insurance, such as health, dental, and vision together, thereby  
22 continuing the historical acceptance of this practice by small



1 insurers who lack coercive power in the marketplace. In these  
2 circumstances, bundling provides broader health care coverage in  
3 single unified policies, ultimately resulting in lower overall  
4 premiums, fostering greater competition within the Hawaii  
5 insurance marketplace, and providing consumers with greater  
6 flexibility, coverage, and pricing options.

7 SECTION 2. Section 431:13-103, Hawaii Revised Statutes, is  
8 amended by amending subsection (a) to read as follows:

9 "(a) The following are defined as unfair methods of  
10 competition and unfair or deceptive acts or practices in the  
11 business of insurance:

12 (1) Misrepresentations and false advertising of insurance  
13 policies. Making, issuing, circulating, or causing to  
14 be made, issued, or circulated, any estimate,  
15 illustration, circular, statement, sales presentation,  
16 omission, or comparison which:

17 (A) Misrepresents the benefits, advantages,  
18 conditions, or terms of any insurance policy;

19 (B) Misrepresents the dividends or share of the  
20 surplus to be received on any insurance policy;



- 1 (C) Makes any false or misleading statement as to the  
2 dividends or share of surplus previously paid on  
3 any insurance policy;
- 4 (D) Is misleading or is a misrepresentation as to the  
5 financial condition of any insurer, or as to the  
6 legal reserve system upon which any life insurer  
7 operates;
- 8 (E) Uses any name or title of any insurance policy or  
9 class of insurance policies misrepresenting the  
10 true nature thereof;
- 11 (F) Is a misrepresentation for the purpose of  
12 inducing or tending to induce the lapse,  
13 forfeiture, exchange, conversion, or surrender of  
14 any insurance policy;
- 15 (G) Is a misrepresentation for the purpose of  
16 effecting a pledge or assignment of or effecting  
17 a loan against any insurance policy;
- 18 (H) Misrepresents any insurance policy as being  
19 shares of stock;
- 20 (I) Publishes or advertises the assets of any insurer  
21 without publishing or advertising with equal



1           conspicuousness the liabilities of the insurer,  
2           both as shown by its last annual statement; or  
3       (J) Publishes or advertises the capital of any  
4           insurer without stating specifically the amount  
5           of paid-in and subscribed capital;

6       (2) False information and advertising generally. Making,  
7           publishing, disseminating, circulating, or placing  
8           before the public, or causing, directly or indirectly,  
9           to be made, published, disseminated, circulated, or  
10          placed before the public, in a newspaper, magazine, or  
11          other publication, or in the form of a notice,  
12          circular, pamphlet, letter, or poster, or over any  
13          radio or television station, or in any other way, an  
14          advertisement, announcement, or statement containing  
15          any assertion, representation, or statement with  
16          respect to the business of insurance or with respect  
17          to any person in the conduct of the person's insurance  
18          business, which is untrue, deceptive, or misleading;

19       (3) Defamation. Making, publishing, disseminating, or  
20          circulating, directly or indirectly, or aiding,  
21          abetting, or encouraging the making, publishing,  
22          disseminating, or circulating of any oral or written



1 statement or any pamphlet, circular, article, or  
2 literature which is false, or maliciously critical of  
3 or derogatory to the financial condition of an  
4 insurer, and which is calculated to injure any person  
5 engaged in the business of insurance;

6 (4) Boycott, coercion, and intimidation.

7 (A) Entering into any agreement to commit, or by any  
8 action committing, any act of boycott, coercion,  
9 or intimidation resulting in or tending to result  
10 in unreasonable restraint of, or monopoly in, the  
11 business of insurance; or

12 (B) Entering into any agreement on the condition,  
13 agreement, or understanding that a policy will  
14 not be issued or renewed unless the prospective  
15 insured contracts for another class or an  
16 additional policy of the same class of insurance  
17 with the same insurer; provided that this  
18 subparagraph shall not apply to any accident and  
19 health or sickness insurer with a market share of  
20 less than five per cent;

21 (5) False financial statements.



1           (A) Knowingly filing with any supervisory or other  
2           public official, or knowingly making, publishing,  
3           disseminating, circulating, or delivering to any  
4           person, or placing before the public, or  
5           knowingly causing, directly or indirectly, to be  
6           made, published, disseminated, circulated,  
7           delivered to any person, or placed before the  
8           public, any false statement of a material fact as  
9           to the financial condition of an insurer; or  
10          (B) Knowingly making any false entry of a material  
11          fact in any book, report, or statement of any  
12          insurer with intent to deceive any agent or  
13          examiner lawfully appointed to examine into its  
14          condition or into any of its affairs, or any  
15          public official to whom the insurer is required  
16          by law to report, or who has authority by law to  
17          examine into its condition or into any of its  
18          affairs, or, with like intent, knowingly omitting  
19          to make a true entry of any material fact  
20          pertaining to the business of the insurer in any  
21          book, report, or statement of the insurer;



1 (6) Stock operations and advisory board contracts.  
2 Issuing or delivering or permitting agents, officers,  
3 or employees to issue or deliver, agency company stock  
4 or other capital stock, or benefit certificates or  
5 shares in any common-law corporation, or securities or  
6 any special or advisory board contracts or other  
7 contracts of any kind promising returns and profits as  
8 an inducement to insurance;

9 (7) Unfair discrimination.

10 (A) Making or permitting any unfair discrimination  
11 between individuals of the same class and equal  
12 expectation of life in the rates charged for any  
13 policy of life insurance or annuity contract or  
14 in the dividends or other benefits payable  
15 thereon, or in any other of the terms and  
16 conditions of the contract;

17 (B) Making or permitting any unfair discrimination in  
18 favor of particular individuals or persons, or  
19 between insureds or subjects of insurance having  
20 substantially like insuring, risk, and exposure  
21 factors, or expense elements, in the terms or  
22 conditions of any insurance contract, or in the





1 rate or amount of premium charge therefor, or in  
2 the benefits payable or in any other rights or  
3 privilege accruing thereunder;

4 (C) Making or permitting any unfair discrimination  
5 between individuals or risks of the same class  
6 and of essentially the same hazards by refusing  
7 to issue, refusing to renew, canceling, or  
8 limiting the amount of insurance coverage on a  
9 property or casualty risk because of the  
10 geographic location of the risk, unless:

11 (i) The refusal, cancellation, or limitation is  
12 for a business purpose which is not a mere  
13 pretext for unfair discrimination; or

14 (ii) The refusal, cancellation, or limitation is  
15 required by law or regulatory mandate;

16 (D) Making or permitting any unfair discrimination  
17 between individuals or risks of the same class  
18 and of essentially the same hazards by refusing  
19 to issue, refusing to renew, canceling, or  
20 limiting the amount of insurance coverage on a  
21 residential property risk, or the personal



1 property contained therein, because of the age of  
2 the residential property, unless:

3 (i) The refusal, cancellation, or limitation is  
4 for a business purpose which is not a mere  
5 pretext for unfair discrimination; or

6 (ii) The refusal, cancellation, or limitation is  
7 required by law or regulatory mandate;

8 (E) Refusing to insure, refusing to continue to  
9 insure, or limiting the amount of coverage  
10 available to an individual because of the sex or  
11 marital status of the individual; however,  
12 nothing in this subsection shall prohibit an  
13 insurer from taking marital status into account  
14 for the purpose of defining persons eligible for  
15 dependent benefits;

16 (F) Terminating or modifying coverage, or refusing to  
17 issue or renew any property or casualty policy or  
18 contract of insurance solely because the  
19 applicant or insured or any employee of either is  
20 mentally or physically impaired; provided that  
21 this subparagraph shall not apply to accident and  
22 health or sickness insurance sold by a casualty



1 insurer; provided further that this subparagraph  
2 shall not be interpreted to modify any other  
3 provision of law relating to the termination,  
4 modification, issuance, or renewal of any  
5 insurance policy or contract;

6 (G) Refusing to insure, refusing to continue to  
7 insure, or limiting the amount of coverage  
8 available to an individual based solely upon the  
9 individual's having taken a human  
10 immunodeficiency virus (HIV) test prior to  
11 applying for insurance; or

12 (H) Refusing to insure, refusing to continue to  
13 insure, or limiting the amount of coverage  
14 available to an individual because the individual  
15 refuses to consent to the release of information  
16 which is confidential as provided in section  
17 325-101; provided that nothing in this  
18 subparagraph shall prohibit an insurer from  
19 obtaining and using the results of a test  
20 satisfying the requirements of the commissioner,  
21 which was taken with the consent of an applicant  
22 for insurance; provided further that any



1 applicant for insurance who is tested for HIV  
2 infection shall be afforded the opportunity to  
3 obtain the test results, within a reasonable time  
4 after being tested, and that the confidentiality  
5 of the test results shall be maintained as  
6 provided by section 325-101;

7 (8) Rebates. Except as otherwise expressly provided by  
8 law:

9 (A) Knowingly permitting or offering to make or  
10 making any contract of insurance, or agreement as  
11 to the contract other than as plainly expressed  
12 in the contract, or paying or allowing, or giving  
13 or offering to pay, allow, or give, directly or  
14 indirectly, as inducement to the insurance, any  
15 rebate of premiums payable on the contract, or  
16 any special favor or advantage in the dividends  
17 or other benefits, or any valuable consideration  
18 or inducement not specified in the contract; or

19 (B) Giving, selling, or purchasing, or offering to  
20 give, sell, or purchase as inducement to the  
21 insurance or in connection therewith, any stocks,  
22 bonds, or other securities of any insurance



1            company or other corporation, association, or  
2            partnership, or any dividends or profits accrued  
3            thereon, or anything of value not specified in  
4            the contract;

5            (9) Nothing in paragraph (7) or (8) shall be construed as  
6            including within the definition of discrimination or  
7            rebates any of the following practices:

8            (A) In the case of any life insurance policy or  
9            annuity contract, paying bonuses to policyholders  
10           otherwise abating their premiums in whole or  
11           in part out of surplus accumulated from  
12           nonparticipating insurance; provided that any  
13           bonus or abatement of premiums shall be fair and  
14           equitable to policyholders and in the best  
15           interests of the insurer and its policyholders;

16           (B) In the case of life insurance policies issued on  
17           the industrial debit plan, making allowance to  
18           policyholders who have continuously for a  
19           specified period made premium payments directly  
20           to an office of the insurer in an amount which  
21           fairly represents the saving in collection  
22           expense;



- 1 (C) Readjustment of the rate of premium for a group
- 2 insurance policy based on the loss or expense
- 3 experience thereunder, at the end of the first or
- 4 any subsequent policy year of insurance
- 5 thereunder, which may be made retroactive only
- 6 for the policy year; and
- 7 (D) In the case of any contract of insurance, the
- 8 distribution of savings, earnings, or surplus
- 9 equitably among a class of policyholders, all in
- 10 accordance with this article;
- 11 (10) Refusing to provide or limiting coverage available to
- 12 an individual because the individual may have a third-
- 13 party claim for recovery of damages; provided that:
- 14 (A) Where damages are recovered by judgment or
- 15 settlement of a third-party claim, reimbursement
- 16 of past benefits paid shall be allowed pursuant
- 17 to section 663-10;
- 18 (B) This paragraph shall not apply to entities
- 19 licensed under chapter 386 or 431:10C; and
- 20 (C) For entities licensed under chapter 432 or 432D:
- 21 (i) It shall not be a violation of this section
- 22 to refuse to provide or limit coverage



1 available to an individual because the  
2 entity determines that the individual  
3 reasonably appears to have coverage  
4 available under chapter 386 or 431:10C; and  
5 (ii) Payment of claims to an individual who may  
6 have a third-party claim for recovery of  
7 damages may be conditioned upon the  
8 individual first signing and submitting to  
9 the entity documents to secure the lien and  
10 reimbursement rights of the entity and  
11 providing information reasonably related to  
12 the entity's investigation of its liability  
13 for coverage.

14 Any individual who knows or reasonably should  
15 know that the individual may have a third-party  
16 claim for recovery of damages and who fails to  
17 provide timely notice of the potential claim to  
18 the entity, shall be deemed to have waived the  
19 prohibition of this paragraph against refusal or  
20 limitation of coverage. "Third-party claim" for  
21 purposes of this paragraph means any tort claim  
22 for monetary recovery or damages that the



1 individual has against any person, entity, or  
2 insurer, other than the entity licensed under  
3 chapter 432 or 432D;

- 4 (11) Unfair claim settlement practices. Committing or  
5 performing with such frequency as to indicate a  
6 general business practice any of the following:
- 7 (A) Misrepresenting pertinent facts or insurance  
8 policy provisions relating to coverages at issue;
  - 9 (B) With respect to claims arising under its  
10 policies, failing to respond with reasonable  
11 promptness, in no case more than fifteen working  
12 days, to communications received from:
    - 13 (i) The insurer's policyholder;
    - 14 (ii) Any other persons, including the  
15 commissioner; or
    - 16 (iii) The insurer of a person involved in an  
17 incident in which the insurer's policyholder  
18 is also involved.

19 The response shall be more than an acknowledgment  
20 that such person's communication has been  
21 received, and shall adequately address the  
22 concerns stated in the communication;





- 1 (C) Failing to adopt and implement reasonable  
2 standards for the prompt investigation of claims  
3 arising under insurance policies;
- 4 (D) Refusing to pay claims without conducting a  
5 reasonable investigation based upon all available  
6 information;
- 7 (E) Failing to affirm or deny coverage of claims  
8 within a reasonable time after proof of loss  
9 statements have been completed;
- 10 (F) Failing to offer payment within thirty calendar  
11 days of affirmation of liability, if the amount  
12 of the claim has been determined and is not in  
13 dispute;
- 14 (G) Failing to provide the insured, or when  
15 applicable the insured's beneficiary, with a  
16 reasonable written explanation for any delay, on  
17 every claim remaining unresolved for thirty  
18 calendar days from the date it was reported;
- 19 (H) Not attempting in good faith to effectuate  
20 prompt, fair, and equitable settlements of claims  
21 in which liability has become reasonably clear;



- 1 (I) Compelling insureds to institute litigation to  
2 recover amounts due under an insurance policy by  
3 offering substantially less than the amounts  
4 ultimately recovered in actions brought by the  
5 insureds;
- 6 (J) Attempting to settle a claim for less than the  
7 amount to which a reasonable person would have  
8 believed the person was entitled by reference to  
9 written or printed advertising material  
10 accompanying or made part of an application;
- 11 (K) Attempting to settle claims on the basis of an  
12 application which was altered without notice,  
13 knowledge, or consent of the insured;
- 14 (L) Making claims payments to insureds or  
15 beneficiaries not accompanied by a statement  
16 setting forth the coverage under which the  
17 payments are being made;
- 18 (M) Making known to insureds or claimants a policy of  
19 appealing from arbitration awards in favor of  
20 insureds or claimants for the purpose of  
21 compelling them to accept settlements or



- 1                   compromises less than the amount awarded in  
2                   arbitration;
- 3           (N)    Delaying the investigation or payment of claims  
4                   by requiring an insured, claimant, or the  
5                   physician of either to submit a preliminary claim  
6                   report and then requiring the subsequent  
7                   submission of formal proof of loss forms, both of  
8                   which submissions contain substantially the same  
9                   information;
- 10           (O)   Failing to promptly settle claims, where  
11                   liability has become reasonably clear, under one  
12                   portion of the insurance policy coverage to  
13                   influence settlements under other portions of the  
14                   insurance policy coverage;
- 15           (P)   Failing to promptly provide a reasonable  
16                   explanation of the basis in the insurance policy  
17                   in relation to the facts or applicable law for  
18                   denial of a claim or for the offer of a  
19                   compromise settlement; and
- 20           (Q)   Indicating to the insured on any payment draft,  
21                   check, or in any accompanying letter that the  
22                   payment is "final" or is "a release" of any claim



1 if additional benefits relating to the claim are  
2 probable under coverages afforded by the policy;  
3 unless the policy limit has been paid or there is  
4 a bona fide dispute over either the coverage or  
5 the amount payable under the policy;

6 (12) Failure to maintain complaint handling procedures.

7 Failure of any insurer to maintain a complete record  
8 of all the complaints which it has received since the  
9 date of its last examination under section 431:2-302.  
10 This record shall indicate the total number of  
11 complaints, their classification by line of insurance,  
12 the nature of each complaint, the disposition of these  
13 complaints, and the time it took to process each  
14 complaint. For purposes of this section, "complaint"  
15 means any written communication primarily expressing a  
16 grievance;

17 (13) Misrepresentation in insurance applications. Making  
18 false or fraudulent statements or representations on  
19 or relative to an application for an insurance policy,  
20 for the purpose of obtaining a fee, commission, money,  
21 or other benefit from any insurer, producer, or  
22 individual; and



1 (14) Failure to obtain information. Failure of any  
2 insurance producer, or an insurer where no producer is  
3 involved, to comply with section 431:10D-623(a), (b),  
4 or (c) by making reasonable efforts to obtain  
5 information about a consumer before making a  
6 recommendation to the consumer to purchase or exchange  
7 an annuity."

8 SECTION 3. The auditor shall perform an analysis of the  
9 effects of the provisions contained in this Act and submit a  
10 report to the legislature no later than twenty days prior to the  
11 convening of the regular session of 2010.

12 SECTION 4. New statutory material is underscored.

13 SECTION 5. This Act shall take effect on July 1, 2008, and  
14 shall be repealed on June 30, 2011.



**Report Title:**

Insurance; Unfair Methods of Competition

**Description:**

Specifies that it is not an unfair method of competition or an unfair or deceptive act or practice for an accident and health or sickness insurer with a market share of less than 5 percent to refuse to issue or renew a policy with a prospective insured unless the prospective insured contracts for another class or an additional policy of the same class of insurance with the same insurer. (HB2256 HD2)

