### HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES TWENTY-FOURTH LEGISLATURE, 2007 STATE OF HAWAII

H.B. NO. <sup>220</sup> H.D. 1

# A BILL FOR AN ACT

RELATING TO TORTS.

### BE IT ENACTED BY THE LEGISLATURE OF THE STATE OF HAWAII:

1 SECTION 1. The increasing cost of malpractice insurance 2 and escalating monetary awards in medical malpractice lawsuits 3 are major factors in the current physician shortage experienced 4 by the State of Hawaii and the neighbor islands in particular. 5 Malpractice insurance premiums have skyrocketed for Hawaii physicians, with physicians in high-risk specialties such as 6 7 surgery and obstetrics, experiencing the highest increase. 8 Monetary awards in malpractice lawsuits are escalating, 9 especially with respect to awards for non-economic damages.

10 As a result of the malpractice situation, many physicians 11 are choosing to retire early, limit their practice, or refrain 12 from practicing in Hawaii. Medical students are avoiding 13 medical specialties that have a high risk of medical malpractice 14 exposure. Defensive medicine may also be practiced, where a 15 physician orders tests and procedures to protect themselves from malpractice liability. Diminishing access to health care is of 16 17 particular concern in rural areas, such as the neighbor islands,



2

where relatively few doctors and fewer specialists and sub specialists continue to practice.

The legislature finds that to address this critical situation, a patient's right to recover non-economic damages for injuries suffered as a result of health care negligence must be balanced against the State's interest in ensuring access to health care services.

8 The purpose of this Act is to place a cap on the amount of 9 non-economic damages that may be recovered in medical 10 malpractice actions in Hawaii, which is contingent on the 11 compliance of all insurers providing professional liability 12 insurance in Hawaii with the premium rate limitations set by 13 this Act.

SECTION 2. Chapter 671, Hawaii Revised Statutes, is amended by adding four new sections to be appropriately designated and to read as follows:

### 17 "§671-A Limitation on noneconomic damages.

18 Notwithstanding section 663-8.7, noneconomic damages as defined

19 in section 663-8.5 shall be limited in medical tort actions to a

20 <u>maximum award of \$500,000.</u>

21 <u>§671-B</u> Assessing percentage of negligence. Upon request
 22 of any nonsettling healthcare provider against whom a plaintiff
 HB220 HD1 HMS 2007-1675



1	alleges a medical tort causing injury, the trier of fact shall
2	consider, in assessing any percentage of negligence or other
3	fault, the negligence or other fault of all alleged parties,
4	including the negligence or other fault of any person or entity
5	who has entered into a settlement with the plaintiff for the
6	claimed damages, even when the settlement has been determined to
7	have been made in good faith, pursuant to section 663-15.5.
8	<b>§671-C Proportionate allocation of economic damages.</b> The
9	amount of economic damages allocated to a healthcare provider in
10	a medical tort action shall be based upon the healthcare
11	provider's proportionate percentage of negligence or other
12	fault.
13	<b>§671-D</b> Noneconomic damages. (a) If the trier of fact
14	renders a verdict for the plaintiff in a medical tort action,
15	the court shall enter judgment of liability against each
16	defendant healthcare provider in accordance with the percentage
17	of negligence or other fault for compensatory damages that is
18	attributed to the healthcare provider by the trier of fact.
19	(b) Where a healthcare provider's degree of negligence is
20	less than twenty-five per cent, then the amount recoverable
21	against that healthcare provider for noneconomic damages shall

HB220 HD1 HMS 2007-1675

Page 3

4

1	be in direct proportion to the degree of the negligence
2	assigned.
3	(c) Judgment shall not be entered against any healthcare
4	provider who has not been named a party or has been released,
5	dismissed, or otherwise discharged as a party pursuant to
6	section 663-15.5."
7	SECTION 3. Section 663-11, Hawaii Revised Statutes, is
8	amended to read as follows:
9	"§663-11 Joint tortfeasors defined. For the purpose of
10	this part, the term "joint tortfeasors" means two or more
11	persons jointly or severally liable in tort for the same injury
12	to person or property, whether or not judgment has been
13	recovered against all or some of them $[-,]$ , except as provided for
14	healthcare providers in chapter 671."
15	SECTION 4. Section 671-1, Hawaii Revised Statutes, is
16	amended to read as follows:
17	"§671-1 Definitions. As used in this chapter:
18	[ <del>(1)</del> ] "Health care provider" <u>or "healthcare provider"</u>
19	means a physician or surgeon licensed under chapter 453, a
20	physician and surgeon licensed under chapter 460, a podiatrist
21	licensed under chapter 463E, a health care facility as defined
22	in section 323D-2, <u>a chiropractor licensed under chapter 442, a</u>
	HB220 HD1 HMS 2007-1675

5

1	dentist licensed under chapter 448, a dental hygienist licensed			
2	under chapter 447, an acupuncture practitioner licensed under			
3	chapter 436E, a massage therapist licensed under chapter 452, a			
4	nurse licensed under chapter 457, an occupational therapist			
5	licensed under chapter 457G, an optometrist licensed under			
6	chapter 459, a pharmacist licensed under chapter 461, a physical			
7	therapist licensed under chapter 461J, a psychologist licensed			
8	under chapter 465, a marriage and family therapist licensed			
9	under chapter 451J, a dietitian licensed under chapter 448B, a			
10	radiologic technologist licensed under chapter 466J, a speech			
11	pathologist or audiologist licensed under chapter 468E, a			
12	veterinarian licensed under chapter 471, and the employees and			
13	legal representatives of any of them. Health care provider			
14	shall not mean any nursing institution or nursing service			
15	conducted by and for those who rely upon treatment by spiritual			
16	means through prayer alone, or employees of such institution or			
17	service.			
18	[ <del>(2)</del> ] "Medical tort" means [ <del>professional negligence, the</del>			
19	rendering of professional service without informed consent, or			
20	an error or omission in professional practice, by a health care			
21	provider, which proximately causes death, injury, or other			
22	damage to a patient.] a negligent act or omission to act by a			
	HB220 HD1 HMS 2007-1675			

.

٠

6

1	healthcare provider in the rendering of professional services,
2	or the rendering of professional service by a healthcare
3	provider without informed consent, which act or omission or
4	rendering of service without informed consent is the proximate
5	cause of a personal injury or wrongful death; provided that such
6	services are within the scope of services for which the provider
7	is licensed and which are not within any restriction imposed by
8	the licensing agency or licensed hospital."
9	SECTION 5. This Act does not affect rights and duties that
10	matured, penalties that were incurred, and proceedings that were
11	begun, before its effective date.
12	SECTION 6. In codifying the new sections added by section
13	2 of this Act the revisor of statutes shall substitute
14	appropriate section numbers for the letters used in designating
15	the new sections in this Act.
16	SECTION 7. Statutory material to be repealed is bracketed
17	and stricken. New statutory material is underscored.
18	SECTION 8. This Act shall take effect upon its approval;
19	provided that this Act shall be repealed on the earlier of
20	January 1, 2015, or upon the failure of any insurer providing
21	professional liability insurance for a health care provider in
22	the state to meet the following requirements:
	HB220 HD1 HMS 2007-1675



•

.



Page 7

.

## H.B. NO. <sup>220</sup> H.D. 1

7

1	(1)	Between July 1, 2007, and December 31, 2007, no
2		insurer providing professional liability insurance for
3		a health care provider in the state may increase the
4		professional liability insurance rates unless a rate
5		increase is required to avoid imminent insolvency or
6		provide a fair rate of return;
7	(2)	Beginning January 1, 2008, all insurers providing
8		professional liability insurance for health care
9		providers in the state shall implement a premium rate
10		that is the lower of the following:
11		(A) Not greater than the rate in effect on January 1,
12		2005, unless to do so would cause imminent
13		insolvency or fail to provide a fair rate of
14		return; or
15		(B) Seventy-five per cent of the lowest rate in
16		effect between January 1, 2005, and December 31,
17		2007, unless to do so would cause imminent
18		insolvency or fail to provide a fair rate of
19		return;
20		and

21 (3) Beginning January 1, 2009, no insurer providing
22 professional liability insurance for a health care



Page 8

provider may implement any rate increase greater than two and one half per cent in any twelve month period, unless a rate increase greater than two and one half per cent is required to avoid imminent insolvency or provide a fair rate of return.

6 Any person may seek a declaratory judgment as to whether an 7 insurer has failed to comply with paragraph 1, 2, or 3 by 8 bringing an action against the insurer in the circuit court of 9 the county in which the petitioner resides or has its principal 10 place of business; provided that upon the repeal of this Act, sections 663-11 and 671-1, Hawaii Revised Statutes, shall be 11 12 reenacted in the same form they were in one day prior to this 13 Act taking effect.



#### Report Title:

Tort Reform; Medical Malpractice; Insurance; Non-economic Damages

#### Description:

Limits non-economic damages in medical tort actions contingent on compliance with premium rate caps by insurers providing professional liability insurance in Hawaii. Sunsets on the earlier of the date on which an insurer does not comply with the premium rate caps, or July 1, 2015. (HB220 HD1)

